ORDINES MILITARES

COLLOQUIA TORUNENSIA HISTORICA Yearbook for the Study of the Military Orders



ISSN (print) 0867-2008 / ISSN (online) 2391-7512

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.12775/OM.2019.012

The Templars and Their Sources. Edited by Karl Borchardt, Karoline Döring, Philippe Josserand, and Helen J. Nicholson. Crusades – Subsidia 10. London–New York: Routledge, 2017. 402 pp., 24 Color Illus., 6 B/W Illus. ISBN: 978-1-138-20190-3.

Over 700 years after the suppression of the Templar Order, scholars are still fascinated with its history. Thus, over the last decade, they have published works that analyze various aspects of the Order's operations, as well as edited collections of documents, primarily those concerning the last years of the Order's existence and the proceedings against it. Despite the large number of publications, however, there are still many aspects of the history of the Templar Order that remain unclear and unexplained, and many unedited sources still await publication. It would therefore appear to be helpful to discuss the possible directions of future research which can be conducted on the basis of hitherto unpublished and less-known documents. Formulating such a framework was precisely the aim of the conference organized by the Monumenta Germaniae Historica and the Historisches Seminar of the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität in Munich, 24–27 April, 2014. One of the results of this conference was the publication of an edited volume, *The Templars and Their Sources*, which is a collection of twenty articles devoted to the different types of sources.

The volume's first section contains articles that focus on the Templars' presence in the Holy Land. Benjamin Z. Kedar analyzes the surviving evidence of the Order's presence in the Aqsa Mosque and its surrounding area. For this purpose, he uses both written sources and data acquired though archaeological research carried out in the last decades. Thanks to this, he is able to provide an account of the Order's architectural activities at its first headquarters. The second article, by Jochen Burgtorf, discusses the connection between the Templars and the rulers of the Kingdom of the Jerusalem. Based on an analysis of select passages from the chronicle of William of Tyre, as well as surviving documents from the royal chancellery (now available in Hans Eberhard Mayer's recent edition), he demonstrates the significant differences in the relations between the Templars and successive monarchs of the Kingdom of Jerusalem. Anthony Luttrell attempts to reconstruct the possible fate of the Templars' archives in Syria and Cyprus after the fall of the Kingdom of Jerusalem. He emphasizes that there is no way to establish, in a defi-

nite way, what happened to the Order's documents, suggesting, though, that the Hospitaller Order may have played a part in their preservation.

Articles in the volume's second section focus on Templar charters. Karl Borchardt discusses the significance of charters for the study of the history of the Templar Order. He indicates the possible venues of research that can be based on these documents. Other articles from this section address regional issues. Michael J. Peixoto and Damien Carraz discuss charters related to French possessions of the Order, describing the methods of compiling, copying, and storing the charters, as well as collecting them in archives in Templar commanderies in Champagne and southern France. Philippe Josserand and Kristjan Toomaspoeg focus on the Iberian peninsula. Josserand discusses documents concerning the activities of the Spanish and Portuguese Templars, while Toomaspoeg discusses documents pertaining to the Order's presence in Portugal. All of the authors emphasize the importance of new editions of sources as well as re-examining existing editions. They indicate the significant extent of the surviving material and the need to conduct research not only on the small scale of regions or countries but Europe as a whole.

Section three offers articles concerning practical aspects of the Order's operations, namely, the Order's structure, organization, strategic issues, and finances. Alan Forey discusses the office of the master deça mer. He points out that the available sources do not allow us to draw definitive conclusions and provides a summary of the current knowledge about this office in the Templar, Hospitaller, and Teutonic Orders. Christian Vogel considers organizational complexities connected to the representation of the Templar Order in court trials. He discusses cases of proctors appointed in different provinces and for various aims. He emphasizes the importance of conducting further research, especially of a comparative nature. John France's article concerns the tactics employed by the Templar Order on the battlefield. France points out the difficulties for research in this area due to the small number of surviving sources. He uses a comparative methodology in order to argue that the Templar Order had a well-organized and highly competent fighting force that was capable of facing much larger forces. Alain Demurger focuses on the Order's financial operations, a topic that has given rise to a lot of myth and speculation (most of it not supported by serious research). Demurger points out the errors made by earlier scholars and emphasizes the need for re-analyzing the existing sources, especially on a larger geographical scale.

The volume's fourth section is dedicated to the Templars' religiosity. Simonetta Cerrini considers the changing role of the rule of the Templars, particularly the customs pertaining to the reception of new brothers. Her article is largely based on a fragment of the documentation from the trial of the Templars, and

BOOK REVIEWS AND BOOK NOTICES 349

can serve as a starting point for further research on this topic. Jochen Schenk discusses the material aspects of liturgy in the Order of the Temple. The basis for his study are inventories which provide us with information as to the material objects connected with religiosity and church services. The author points out that there is a need to create tools that would make access to these inventories easier and to cover as much as possible of the geographical area where Templar commanderies were located. Arno Mentzel-Reuters attempts to recreate the most important elements of the Templars' religiosity. Using a variety of sources and comparing the material to Cistercian examples, he emphasizes the Templars' commitment to the cult of the Passion of Christ.

The volume's fifth section focuses on the suppression of the Order and its consequences. Helen J. Nicholson and Philip Slavin analyze the Templars' properties in England and Wales on the basis of account rolls and estate records compiled between the arrest of the brothers in 1308 and the Hospitallers' acquisition of their properties in 1313. These sources (which are difficult to access) allow for a reconstruction of the Order's properties in these regions, and the article is a forerunner to a larger editorial project. Francesco Tommasi focuses on the fate of the Italian Templars after the Council of Vienne, drawing several general conclusions with regard to the situation of the Italian brothers after the Order's suppression. He also expands the biographies of two historical figures: Giacomo da Moncucco, the *cubicularius* of Clement V, and Pierre de Bologna, the last Templar proctor in the papal curia. Elena Bellomo discusses an issue that has hitherto not received much attention, namely, the role of the notaries in the inquiry into the Temple. Her study focuses on the inquiries carried out in northern Italy and demonstrates the complexities and legal problems connected to them.

In volume's final section turns to the popular myths which began to circulate after the suppression of the Order. Karlheinz Dietz discusses the alleged connection between the Templars and the Shroud of Turin. He uses a prosopographical and etymological approach to demonstrate that there was no connection between the Templars and the persons who stored the Shroud. John Walker discusses the main sources of the fantastical myths about the Templars' origins and decline. Although these issues have already received scholarly attention, one should emphasize the author's attempt to reconstruct the mechanisms which led to the creation of Templar myths which have their origins in medieval documents.

The volume's articles remind us of the various fragments and aspects of Templar history which still require in-depth analysis. The authors provide suggestions for further research and declarations of future publications of hitherto unused sources, and they propose the use of new research methods to analyze issues which have already received some academic attention. The volume therefore of-

fers a thorough summary of the current state of academic research on the history of the Order of the Temple carried out in various regions.

Magdalena Satora (Warszawa)*

^{*} ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2393-5592