


Marta Sara Stempień*

 0000-0002-6463-0445

THE IMAGE OF TURKEY IN THE ISLAMIC STATE'S PROPAGANDA MAGAZINES: A CONTENT ANALYSIS

ABSTRACT

At the beginning of the 21st century, the establishment of the caliphate remained invariably the strategic goal of the global Salafi-jihadist movement. The Islamic State's (IS; often referred to as ISIS – Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham; Dā‘ish or Daesh) primary goal of establishing a caliphate has placed ‘apostate’ regimes rather than Western countries, as their primary enemies. Such country is Turkey, which IS describes as *tağut*. Indeed, the first issue of the *Dabiq* magazine targets Turkey as a hostile tyrannical country. This article examines the IS's approach to Turkey, which, due to cultural differences, is located on the border of Western and Middle Eastern civilizations (this approach to Turkey's role is supported by its membership in the North Atlantic Treaty Organization – NATO and negotiations of its accession to the European Union – EU). The author attempts to explore the main themes related to Turkey in IS's English-language magazines *Dabiq* and *Rumiyah*, as well as the Turkish-language *Konstantiniyye*. The article aims to investigate whether Turkey is a main enemy and indirectly present whether its involvement in the fight against IS is/was linked to the increased terrorist threat in Turkey. The author hopes that this research will enrich the knowledge about jihadi propaganda and IS's approach to close enemies (*al-adou al-qareeb*).

Keywords: digital jihad; Islamic State; Turkey; content analysis; propaganda

* Siedlce University of Natural Sciences and Humanities (Poland), e-mail: marta.stempien@uph.edu.pl

INTRODUCTION

At the beginning of the 21st century, the establishment of the caliphate remained invariably the strategic goal of the global Salafi-jihadist movement. The Islamic State decided that the new order under the caliphate could only be brought by establishing a community (*jama'ah*) that leads through emigration (*hijrah*). The next step in establishing the caliphate was to prevent the apostate regime (*tağūt*) from achieving stability, which would allow it to achieve the *status quo*, similar to that in Muslim countries ruled for decades by tyrants (*tawaghit*). They prevent the establishment of a caliphate with the help of apostates (*murtadin*), Muslims who violate the principle of *al-wala' wel-barra'*, work for tyrants and other infidels, such as foreign powers. According to the views of Ibn Taimiyya or Sayyid Qutb, IS extended the category of apostates to all Muslims who refuse to participate in the holy war (Habeck, 2016, p. 21; Laqueur, 2004, p. 33). The fourth and final phase of the plan was to be the establishment of a sovereign state (*tamkin*) (*Dabiq* 1 2014, pp. 34–37). The very first issue of *Dabiq* presents Turkey as one of the tyrannical countries, which is of IS's interest (*Dabiq* 1, 2014, p. 3). This means that, unlike al-Qaeda, the United States and Western civilization (distant enemy; *al-adou al-baeed*) are not a primary enemy. They are apostate regimes (close enemy; *al-adou al-qareeb*) cooperating with the West; and one of them is Turkey (Brooke, 2010, p. 45; Hegghammer, 2016, pp. 11–32).

IS divides society into at least four categories: tyrants, apostates, heretics, polytheists, and true believers (Hafez, 2010, pp. 19–44). IS considers members of Muslim regimes that rule using the Shariah unlawfully and refuse to return to real Islam as *tawaghit*, i.e., tyrants.

The Islamic State has an extremely extensive propaganda strategy. Various types of materials placed every day in digital space are to convince the audience of the need for support and joining the IS's cause in this state-building project – the caliphate (called by the author the quasi-caliphate Stempień, 2019, p. 69). Jihadists basically use all modern means of communication; they want to reach the largest possible audience (Klausen, 2015, pp. 1–22). The main recipient of the jihadi content is an Arabic-speaking audience, so the online content is mostly published by Al-Hayat Media Center in this language (e.g., Al-Nabā or Al-Masrā). A significant portion of it is also published in other languages, mostly in English.

The media content related to IS's opponents raises many questions that are worth examining. The present article performs a content analysis of *Dabiq*, *Rumiyah*, and *Konstantiniyee* magazines to record how IS sees its enemies. This article examines the IS approach to Turkey, which, due to cultural differences, is located on the border of Western and Middle Eastern civilizations. This approach to Turkey's role is supported by its membership in the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) and negotiations on its accession to the European Union (EU). The author hopes that this research will enrich knowledge about Islamic State's propaganda and its approach to Turkey viewed as a close enemy (*al-adou al-qareeb*).

THEORETICAL APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

Recently, research on the problem of jihadism has evolved significantly, in particular regarding propaganda published in cyberspace. The sources regarding IS propaganda as such are rich. Some of them refer holistically to the problem, stressing its methods of gaining support and attempting to recruit new followers, and the other to its certain aspects: categorization of

messages placed in propaganda magazines; the most evident propaganda methods and main themes exploited; IS's communicative strategies (Andersen & Sandberg, 2018; Bröcklinga et al., 2018, pp. 240–294; Welch, 2018, pp. 186–198; Lakomy, 2018; Fahmy, 2020; Lakomy, 2019, pp. 143–161). As mentioned above, it is not possible to find publications on the holistic image of Turkey in IS propaganda materials. Most publications deal with broader issues; there is no direct reference to Turkey's image in Islamic State's propaganda in the literature. Due to the fact that Turkey is struggling with the problem of terrorism, mainly related to Kurdish activities, many analyses refer to the issue of terrorism in this sense (Dal, 2016, pp. 1396–1420).

In recent years, the formation of a culture of jihadism has become an essential element of Jihadist propaganda. Creating the image of enemies, including tyrants, is undoubtedly an element connecting the military and non-military aspects of jihadi activity. Many of the recruits have encountered jihadism for the first time through online content. Although in the case of jihadi groups, it is difficult to differentiate any sphere deprived of military influence, because everything comes down to a physical fight against the enemy, this study focuses on the content analysis of material published by IS. The significance of this research lies in the importance of these materials, as highly developed tools used for radicalization and the creation of the image of enemies.

The Islamic State media apparatus consists of the following: Al-Furqan Media, Al-I'tisam Media, Ajnad Media and Al-Hayat Media Center, the A'maq news agency, Al-Bayan radio station and Tawheed television. Furthermore, during territorial expansion, jihadists established media offices in each province (Zelin, 2015, pp. 85–97; York, 2015, pp. 30–31). The oldest element of the media apparatus, responsible for videos – Al-Furqan Institute for Media Production was established in 2006. However, the most recognizable is Al-Hayat Media Center, created in 2014 (Alazreg, 2016). It produces and distributes videos, bulletins, and magazines. These include bulletins such as Al-Nabā and Al-Masrā, the English-language Dabiq and Rumiya, the French-language Dar Al-Islam, the Russian-language Istok, and the Turkish-language Konstantiniyye. In addition, jihadists use social media; online forums; websites for specific areas, such as music (posting playlists with nasheeds), or jihadi literature.

This article is a case study. Research methods include theoretical methods: scientific literature analysis, systemic analysis, case study, classification, generalization and empirical method in the form of data analysis. Central to this case study were Dabiq, Rumiya, and Konstantiniyye magazines. Each issue is divided thematically and contains from seven to more than a dozen articles, listed at the beginning in the table of contents (Wignell et al., 2017, pp. 2–20). All issues contain graphic pages with short, explanatory texts (infographics). Quantitative and qualitative analysis of their content allowed to show how IS sees Turkey and shapes its goals and actions towards this state. This study focuses on text and images that serve to support word content. Quantitative research focuses on the period from July 2014 to September 2017. The article aims to determine whether Turkey-related content is important for IS propaganda, to investigate whether Turkey is a prominent enemy, and indirectly present whether its involvement in the fight against the Islamic State is/was linked to the increased terrorist threat in Turkey. The author tries to answer the following research question: how is Turkey presented in propaganda magazines. In order to answer this question, it is necessary to consider whether turkey-related themes often appear in IS propaganda magazines; how the presented content differs in particular periods, and if so, what could be the reason

for this. The answer to these problems will allow for the categorization of the main themes discussed in the analyzed magazines.

The data set for this research is based on the 15 issues of *Dabiq*, 13 issues of *Rumiyah*, and 7 issues of *Konstantiniyye* downloaded from *Jihadology.net* and *iproject.org*. Due to the limited space of the article, the author decided to use the detailed quantitative analysis of the content of *Dabiq* (15) and *Rumiyah* (13). These magazines have been published in a much larger number of issues than *Konstantiniyye* (7). All keywords and images related to Turkey (Turkey, Turkish, Turk, Turks) were found, cataloged, then classified according to their subject, and analyzed. The author also analyzed the occurrence of the last name of the President of Turkey, Recep Tayyip Erdoğan. In total, 285 words related to Turkey were found: 134 in *Dabiq* and 151 in *Rumiyah* (see table 1 and table 3). The analysis was enriched with studies on images related to Turkey. After the quantitative analysis of the content, the author focused on qualitative research, focusing on issues that contained a significant number of keywords.

TURKEY'S ENGAGEMENT IN THE FIGHT AGAINST THE ISLAMIC STATE

Turkey suffered some major attacks perpetrated by IS. According to official statistics, in the first five months of 2016, 989 persons were detained on suspicion of having links with IS in Turkey. 228 of them were arrested. Along with the Islamic State's territorial expansion, the attacks on Turkey's border provinces became more intense. In August 2015, Turkey officially joined the international coalition against IS, which resulted in the mobilization of domestic followers. It is also reflected in IS publications. In 2016, IS toughened its position toward Turkey, calling its authorities a 'hostile regime.' Jihadists started social media campaigns #tağutnedir ("what is tağut?") and #tağut.

Nevertheless, many times IS has not taken responsibility for its apparent attacks in Turkey. It may be associated with an attempt to gain support from the minority of Turkish Sunni Muslims. Turkey is a critical logistical base for IS. On the other hand, Ankara also seems to be ignoring some factors. One of the theories on tolerating the flow of foreign fighters by Turkish authorities was the belief that they would speed up the fall of Bashar al-Assad. For many observers, Turkey has seemed reluctant to put all its resources into the fight against jihadists. The fight against the Kurdistan Workers' Party (Kurdish: *Partiya Karkerên Kurdistanê* – PKK) seemed more important, and IS was engaged in a fight against Syrian Kurdish groups loyal to the PKK (Crisis Group, 2016).

As a result of the growing threat from IS and PKK, Turkey referred to Article 4 of the North Atlantic Treaty (1949). This article refers to Member States consultations "whenever, in the opinion of any of them, the territorial integrity, political independence, or security of any of the Parties is threatened." On 28 July 2015, an extraordinary North Atlantic Council meeting was held at Turkey's request, but Ankara did not request NATO military support. However, it agreed to use the Incirlik base to conduct anti-terrorist operations in Syria by the US forces (Sönmez, 2019, p. 7). The Operation Euphrates Shield began on August 24, 2016. Turkey's growing involvement in the fight against IS has been evident since the proclamation of the caliphate. The terrorist attack in the Turkish city of Suruç in July 2015, located

near the Syrian city Kobanê, can be considered a turning point. The area where the attack occurred was the territory of clashes with IS's troops.¹

In addition, after the attack, Turkey referred to Article 5 of the North Atlantic Treaty (1949). The collective defence mechanism can be activated only in situations of real threat to allied security. In recent decades, attempts to refer to this record have repeatedly failed, causing tensions between allies. The perception of a given threat as a factor destabilizing common interest has not always been clearly interpreted by all NATO members.² Although the conflict in Ukraine shows the timeliness of the threat from Russia, in the 21st century, the terrorist threat began to outweigh traditional conventional conflicts. For many years, the North Atlantic structures did not have the opportunity to check the functioning of the basic obligation – the security guarantees under art. 5. More than 52 years passed before this article was used. The signatories of the Washington Treaty primarily perceived it as a mechanism through which the United States could come to the rescue of its allies. However, the world changed, and after September 11, 2001, the US referred to Article 5, and the NATO Council declared that the attacks on the US are synonymous with an attack on the entire Alliance. This was not just a symbolic expression of support and solidarity, it resulted in a series of decisions aimed at strengthening the anti-terrorist campaign (Minkina, 2002, pp. 109–113).

The creators of the Washington Treaty could not have foreseen that an attack on one member would not be made by a state or a group of states, but by a terrorist structure. Turkey's attempts to refer to art. 5 show what a great threat such entities pose. IS threatens all NATO's states. It is likely that IS is provoking clashes between the Turkish authorities and the Kurds, just as it provokes animosity in Iraq and Syria to fuel the hostilities. Stimulation of animosity could probably have been the goal of IS that prevented deeper cooperation between Turkey and the West.

ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION OF *DABIQ* CONTENT

Dabiq magazine is a valuable source of information because it is considered one of the flagship magazines of the IS. The name *Dabiq* refers to a town in the Aleppo province in Syria, on the border with Turkey. In 1516, there was a substantial battle between the Ottoman Empire and the Mamluks, which ended with a victory of the Empire. As a result, the last recognized caliphate was consolidated. The title is symbolic, indicating the hegemonic aspirations of the Islamic State. Al Hayat Media Centre published 15 issues of that magazine between 5 July 2014 and 31 July 2016.

¹ In 2016, Kurds began to recover these areas from the hands of the IS. The majority of its inhabitants are Kurds, which further complicates the situation in this region.

² Attempts to use Article 5 have taken place several times. In the 1950s France referred to it in connection with the situation in Indochina and Algeria, in the 1960s the United States in the face of the Vietnam War. The reference to the article's provisions was also considered during the Gulf War in 1990, wondering whether its obligations related to the retaliatory attack of Iraq on allied Turkey.

Table 1. The use of keywords related to Turkey in *Dabiq*

Issue number	Title	Pages number	Publication date	No. of key-words	Number of sections	No. of images
#1	<i>The Return of Khilafah</i>	26	5 July 2014	0	0	0
#2	<i>The Flood</i>	44	27 July 2014	4	3 – Report (2); Feature (1); The Enemy's Words (1)	0
#3	<i>The Call to Hijrah</i>	42	10 Aug. 2014	1	1 – Article (1)	0
#4	<i>The Failed Crusade</i>	56	11 Oct. 2014	4	2 – Report (1); Feature (3)	0
#5	<i>Remaining and Expanding</i>	40	21 Nov. 2014	3	2 – Report (2); Special (1)	0
#6	<i>Al-Qa'idah of Waziristan: A Testimony From Within.</i>	63	29 Dec. 2014	2	1 – Report (2)	0
#7	<i>From Hypocrisy to Apostasy</i>	83	12 Feb. 2015	2	2 – Report (1); In the Words of the Enemy (1)	0
#8	<i>Shari'ah Alone Will Rule Africa</i>	68	30 March 2015	10	2 – Article (4); Feature(6)	0
#9	<i>They Plot and Allah Plots</i>	79	21 May 2015	25	6 – Article (3); History (5); Report (2); Feature (10); In the Words of the Enemy (2); Interview (3)	2
#10	<i>The Laws of All or the Laws of Men</i>	79	13 July 2015	20	5 – Article (1); Report (10); Feature (3); In the Words of the Enemy (5); Interview (1)	3
#11	<i>From the Battle of Al-Ahزاب to the War of Coalitions</i>	66	9 Sept. 2015	41	5 – Article x2 (32); History (1); Shuhada' (1); Feature (5); In the Words of the Enemy (2)	4

Table 1. The use... (cont.)

Issue number	Title	Pages number	Publication date	No. of key-words	Number of sections	No. of images
#12	<i>Just Terror</i>	66	18 Nov. 2015	15	2 – Article x2 (11); In the Words of the Enemy (4)	1
#13	<i>The Rafidah: From Ibn Sa'ba to the Dajjal</i>	56	19 Jan. 2015	2	2 – From the Pages of History (1); Military Reports (1)	0
#14	<i>The Murtadd Brotherhood</i>	68	13 April 2016	5	2 – Article (3); Feature (2)	1
#15	<i>Break the Cross</i>	82	31 July 2016	0	0	0

In Issues 3, 6, 7, and 13 there are only one or two references to Turkey. In Issues 2, 4, and 6, Turkey is hardly mentioned. In the first and last issue, Turkey is not mentioned (see Table 1). Although the first issue does not use words related to Turkey, it refers to the *tawaghīt* category mentioned in the introduction to this article. The author also analyzed the occurrence of the last name of President Erdoğan, as an important creator of internal and regional state policy. He is mentioned 18 times: 2 words in Issue 2, 1 word in Issue 9, 12 words in Issue 10, 2 words in Issue 12, 1 description of the image in Issue 13.

The first issue that devotes more space to Turkey is Issue 8 (2015). Four keywords were found in the article *The Allies of Al-Qā'idah in Shām* and six in Feature section entitled *Irjā' the Most Dangerous Bid'ah*. The first article criticizes the activities of Al-Qaeda in Syria. Turkey is presented as the ally of Al-Qaeda in Syria, next to the Syrian National Coalition, the Syrian Interim Government, Saudi Arabia and Qatar (More on the relations between IS and Al-Qaeda see: Cantey, 2018, pp. 757–775). In the Feature section, Turkey is mentioned as the base of the Free Syrian Army (FSA) that belongs, according to IS, to the category of secularist factions (Dabiq 8, 2015, pp. 52–53).

Issue 9 contains 25 keywords in the largest number of sections. 10 keywords were found in the Feature section entitled *And Allah is the Best of Plotters*, in which a lot of space is devoted to the enemies of IS (Dabiq 9, 2015, pp. 50–59). Turkey is seen there as a part of “the triad of apostasy,” next to Āl Salūl (supporters of the Saudi monarchy), and Qatar, supported by “the Arab and non-Arab tawāghīt of Bahrain, Kuwait, the UAE, Egypt, Jordan, Morocco, Senegal, Bangladesh, Sudan, Pakistan, and Somalia, to aid the tāghūt regime of Abd Rabbuh Mansur Hadi against the Rāfidah of the Houthis and Ali Abdullah Saleh in Yemen.” (Dabiq 9, 2015, p. 58). Dabiq states that Turkey is concerned about the aspirations of “the crusaders' Kurdish allies” and the Shi'a opposition to the Erdoğan regime. According to IS, Turkey requested “from its Sahwah allies in Halab [...] to begin a war against the PKK [...], after a long truce had been observed by the PKK and the Sahwah factions including the Jawlāni front.” (Dabiq 9, 2015, p. 57).

In that issue, there is also a photo of Qatari and Turkish politicians referred to as apostates (Dabiq 9, 2015, p. 58) and a diagram entitled *Strange Bedfellows*, with the descrip-

tion: “Parties that display friction or outright aggression toward one another are finding themselves aligned in a desire to counter Islamic State,” in which lines between states present shared interests.

Issue 10 also contains a significant number of keywords found in 5 sections. The richest in content related to the analyzed problem was a report entitled *American Kurdistan*. It characterizes the internal situation in Turkey and speculates about the end of Erdoğan’s rule (Dabiq 10, 2015, pp. 30–35). Turkey’s president is mentioned 12 times in this issue. He also appears in two of the three images. On the first, he is pictured alone, on the second in the company of Sheikh Tamim bin Hamad Al Thani – the Emir of Qatar. The third image shows Selahattin Demirtaş, the Chairman of the Peoples’ Democratic Party (Turkish: *Halkların Demokratik Partisi* – HDP) (Dabiq 10, 2015, p. 10, 32, 60).

The highest number of keywords in Dabiq, which is 41, was found in Issue 11. They are placed in five sections. 31 of 41 words were used in the article titled *The Allies of Al-Qā'idah in Shām: Part 4*. It describes Turkish involvement in the coalition against the IS, as a member of “the crusader NATO alliance.” It mentions Turkish involvement in campaigns launched and led by the US including: Operation Enduring Freedom in Afghanistan (OEF), Operation Enduring Freedom in the Horn of Africa (OEF-HOA), and Operation Inherent Resolve in Iraq and Syria (CJTF-OIR). According to Dabiq, “The Turkish government is one that legislates, executes, and judges by man-made laws. Its army is assembled to defend the Turkish tāghūt and their crusader allies. This government and army are one of blatant apostasy [...]” Then the article emphasizes that that “[...] Turkey partakes in the imprisonment of muhājirīn and together with America strikes positions of the Islamic State.” (Dabiq 11, 2015, pp. 6–9).

In Issue 11, one can also find several images of Turkish decision makers. The very first is on the cover. The same image appears on page 46, as the main photo of the article *From the Battle of the Al-Azhab to the War of Coalitions*. The image shows President Erdoğan with US President Barack Obama. In this article, Turkey is once again referred to as part of “crusader coalition” – Operation Inherent Resolve. In the other two images, Turkish politicians are shown in the company of Gaza and NATO decision makers, referred to as tāghūt and crusaders (Dabiq 11, 2015, pp. 46–47).

In Issue 12, all content related to Turkey can be found in two sections (see Table 1). The most attention was paid to Turkey in the article *You Think They are Together but Their Hearts are Divided*. In this article, Ankara is mentioned in the subsection on the PKK and the Turkish-Kurdish dispute. The PKK is defined as the US ally, whose fighters are “filling the role of America’s ground forces.” Dabiq also emphasizes that “the Turkish tawāghīt” sees “Russia’s plan to build up its relationship with the PKK and support them. And with Turkey being a NATO member, backing the PKK against the murtadd regime of Turkey would not be strange for the crusaders of Russia, especially considering that Russia had done so in its Soviet past.” (Dabiq 12, 2015, pp. 43–46).

Furthermore, in Issue 12 the same image as in issue 10 was used. However, the description is different: “The allies of the Jawlānī front criticized by Abū Firās are backed by the Turkish and Qatari tawāghīt.” (Dabiq 10, 2015, p. 10).

The last image was found in Issue 14. It is marked with a description: “The tāghūt Erdoğan and the tāghūt Moshe Katsav,” who was the eighth President of Israel from 2000 to 2007 (Dabiq 14, 2016, p. 31).

Quantitative analysis showed that the most keywords related to Turkey placed in one section were found in the article *The Allies of Al-Qā'idah in Shām: Part 4* – 31. The article describes the participation of the Turkish government in the US-led coalition against the IS. It highlights its membership in “the crusader NATO alliance,” that is the participation in the Operation Inherent Resolve in Iraq and Syria (Dabiq 11, 2015, pp. 6–9). Thus, a lot of space was devoted to Turkey in issues 9, 10, 11, and 12 (see Table 1), probably due to the deepening of the Russian-Turkish dispute at the time, which occurred after the shooting down of the Russian Sukhoi Su-24M aircraft near the Syrian–Turkish border, in October 2015. In response to this incident, Russia imposed economic sanctions on Turkey, which included a suspension of visa-free travel for Turkish citizens and restrictions on imports of Turkish products.

In summary, most words referring to Turkey were found in Issue 11 – 41, however, the largest number of sections has been used in Issues 9 – 6. Most words are found in section Article – 55. A significant part of the topics related to Turkey were found in the five-part article entitled *The Allies of Al-Qā'idah in Sham*, which condemned AQ-aligned jihadists in Syria. The series appeared in five issues of *Dabiq* (8, 9, 10, 11, 12). It also was the most frequently used section (see Table 2). In addition, 11 images related to Turkey were found in *Dabiq*. The number of keywords indicates that this state is one of the major close enemies. Multiple uses of the image of President Erdoğan indicate that Turkish decision makers are targeted by jihadists. An earlier analysis, presented by the author in the article *Russia in the Eyes of Islamic State: An Analysis of the content of Dabiq and Rumiyah Magazines and Russia's Involvement in the Fight against the Islamic State* (2019), indicates that topics related to Turkey were more extensive than those dealing with Russia (Stempień, 2019). This was not an overwhelming dominance, but it may indicate a focus on issues related to close enemies (*al-adou al-qareeb*) (see The Introduction).

Table 2. The number of keywords and sections used in *Dabiq*

Section	Number of keywords	Number of sections
Cover	0	0
Table of Contents	0	0
Article	55	9
Breaking News/News	0	0
Enemy's Words/In the Words of the Enemy	15	6
Fatwa	0	0
Foreword/Introduction	0	0
Feature	30	7
From Our Sisters	0	0
Hikmah (Wisdom)	0	0

Table 2. The number... (cont.)

Section	Number of keywords	Number of sections
History	7	3
Interview	4	2
Operations/Military Operations	1	1
Report	20	7
Shuhada	1	1
Special	1	1
Statement	0	0
To Our Sisters	0	0
Jointly	134	37

ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION OF RUMIYAH CONTENT

The media output reflects the changes and key events in the expansion and shrinkage of the self-proclaimed caliphate of the IS. It also applies to issues related to Turkey (Bröcklinga, et al., pp. 261–263). With the loss of the city of Dabiq, in September 2016 (Shaheen, 2016), Rumiyah has replaced Dabiq (Alexandre & Alexander, 2015, pp. 74–75). The title of the magazine refers to the well-known hadiths describing that the Muslim armies would conquer Constantinople and then Rome. The loss of the self-proclaimed caliphate's capital – Ar-Raqqa in September 2017 forced jihadists to cease the publication of Rumiyah.

Table 3. The use of keywords in *Rumiyah*

Issue number	Title	Pages number	Publication date	Number of key-words	Number of sections	No. of images
#1	<i>Rumiyah issue 1</i>	38	5 Sept. 2016	1	1 – Article (1)	1
#2	<i>Rumiyah issue 2</i>	38	4 Oct. 2016	2	1 – News: operations (2)	0
#3	<i>Rumiyah issue 3</i>	46	11 Nov. 2016	21	3 – Foreword (8); Exclusive (4); Article (9)	4

Table 3. The use... (cont.)

Issue number	Title	Pages number	Publication date	Number of key-words	Number of sections	No. of images
#4	<i>Rumiyah issue 4</i>	40	7 Dec. 2016	27	3 – Foreword (1); Exclusive (5); News: military and covert operations (21)	2
#5	<i>Rumiyah issue 5</i>	44	6 Jan. 2017	18	3 – Foreword (1); Article (2); News: military and covert operations (15)	4
#6	<i>Rumiyah issue 6</i>	44	4 Feb. 2017	33	3 – Article x2 (28), Interview (5); Feature (1)	1
#7	<i>Rumiyah issue 7</i>	38	Feb. 2017	15	2 – Foreword (5); News: military and covert operations (10)	0
#8	<i>Rumiyah issue 8</i>	48	5 Apr. 2017	2	1 – Feature (2)	0
#9	<i>The Ruling on the Belligerent Christians</i>	58	4 May 2017	1	1 – Exclusive (1)	0
#10	<i>The Jihad in East Asia</i>	46	7 June 2017	0	0	0
#11	<i>The Ruling on Ghani-mah, Fay and Ihtitab</i>	60	13 July 2017	6	1 – Shuhada (6)	2
#12	<i>It Will be a Fire that Burns the Cross and its People in Raqqa</i>	46	6 Aug. 2017	5	1 – Article (2); Interview (3)	0
#13	<i>Allah Cast Terror into their Hearts</i>	44	9 Sept. 2017	20	2 – Foreword (2); Sisters (18)	2

In *Rumiyah*, the most space is devoted to Turkey in issues from 3, 4, 6 and 13. In Issue 3, there are 21 references to Turkey in 3 sections (see Table 3). Nine of them were found in the article *Towards the Major Malhamah³ of Dabiq*. The article referring to history indicates that even today West and Middle East are divided and oppose one another (*Rumiyah* 3, 2016, pp. 24–26). Eight other keywords were found in the Foreword section that describe “the modern crusade against the usurped Muslim lands, a campaign aimed at fortifying the rule of taḡut.” The introduction already threatens Turkey: “Erdoğan and his government did

³ The singular form of *malahim*, battles that occur before the Hour. They are described in several hadith of the Prophet.

not heed the lesson of their Crusader allies, whom the mujahidin attacked [...] making their markets and entertainment sites arenas for open war, as occurred in Paris and Brussels.” It also calls for attacks on Turkish forces and supporters (Rumiyah 3, 2016, pp. 2–3). Issue 3 also consists images. The first presents Erdoğan raising his hands to the crowd covered by Turkish flags. Second shows the destroyed city of Diyarbakir. Both appear in the Foreword section. The next one can be found in the Exclusive section; it is a picture of Erdoğan and another picture of the attack in Diyarbakir (Rumiyah 3, 2016, p. 3, 8).

Issue 4 contains the second largest number of keywords, which is 27. The vast majority of them were found in News: military and covert operations section – 21. The subsection devoted to *The War on Apostate Turkey* lists 14 attacks carried out by IS supporters against Turkey. It also contains image with the description: “The Turkish murtaddin build a wall to prevent the muhajirin from entering Sham.” (Rumiyah 4, 2016, pp. 34–37). The next one shows president Erdoğan and president Putin. The last image is located in the News section and shows the Istishhadi attack on the Turkish army (Rumiyah 4, 2016, p. 35).

Issue 5 mentions Turkey 18 times. In this case, the largest number of keywords also appears in the section News: military and covert operations – 15. Rumiyah lists 14 attacks carried out by IS’s supporters. Such a significant number may indicate increased care in conducting attacks in Turkey, especially in the border region. This section also contains an image marked with the description: “Aftermath of the attack on the Crusader celebration in Istanbul” (Rumiyah 5, 2017, pp. 36–37). Moreover, the introduction is accompanied by a photo of president Erdoğan greeting president Putin (Rumiyah 5, 2017, p. 2, 36–37; Rumiyah 4, 2016, p. 5).

Issue 6 contains the most keywords; they are placed in three sections (see Table 3). 27 of 33 were used in the article *The Safe Zone: A Conspiracy, and Delusions of Consolidation*. It describes Turkish involvement in the war against the IS. Rumiyah states that Erdoğan “has been marketing the idea of an area in which those who are fleeing from Nusayri⁴ airstrikes might gather, offering them places of refuge, services, and protection from bombardment.” It accuses Turkey of raising the Safe Zone project; the area that is used as a base to fight against jihadists (Guiton, 2014). According to Rumiyah: “Turkey seeks to take control over the area stretching between Jarabulus and ‘Azaz [...] which would prevent the areas ruled by the apostate PKK militants east and west of the Euphrates from joining together” (Rumiyah 6, 2017, pp. 18–20). It also refers to Turkish cooperation with Russia and the lack of agreement with the United States and its NATO allies. The article indicates a weakening of NATO, as it withdrew “advanced ‘Patriot’ air defense missile system, which would have been able to guard the safe zone from Nusayri planes.” The article is accompanied by an image of Erdoğan and Putin (Rumiyah 6, 2017, pp. 18–20). Another image shows Turkish interior minister, Süleyman Soylu (Rumiyah 6, 2017, p. 14).

In Issue 7, the content related to Turkey can be found in section Foreword entitled *That Allah Should Test Those Who Believe and Destroy the Disbelievers* and News: military and covert operations (see Table 3). In issues from 8 to 12, the total number of keywords did not exceed 15. In Issue 11, information on Turkey is located in one section Shuhada (see Table 3) and appears as a transit state for jihadi migration (*hijrah*). In addition, the article is accompanied by a photo of the Greece-Turkey border crossing (Rumiyah 11, 2017, pp. 44–52).

⁴ In the IS propaganda Al-Assad’s regime is referred to as Nusayri.

In the last issue, topics related to Turkey can be found in two sections: Foreword and Sisters (see Table 3). In the foreword, Rumiya mentions the terrorist attack; stabbing and killing of one of Turkish policemen (Rumiya 13, 2017, p. 5). In the Sisters section entitled *The Hijrah of Umm Sulaym al-Muhajirah*, one can find information about the woman who traveled to the caliphate through Gaziantep via Istanbul (Yayla & Speckhard, 2016). Two images in issue 13 show Gaziantep Airport and the border between Turkey and Syria (Rumiya 13, 2017, pp. 30–35).

In conclusion, most keywords can be found in Issue 6 – 33, however, the largest number of sections has been used in Issue 3. The most words were found in the section News: Operations/ News: Military and Covert Operations – 48. Slightly fewer keywords were used in the Article section – 41. The number of keywords indicates that Turkey is one of the main enemies. However, the inclusion of keywords in the Operations section may indicate that after IS's territorial defeats, actions have been directed against Turkey and Turkish interests in the region (see Table 4).

Table 4. The number of keywords and sections used in the *Rumiya* magazine

Section	Number of keywords	Number of sections
<i>Cover/ Table of Contents</i>	0	0
<i>Article/Articles</i>	41	5
<i>Exclusive</i>	10	3
<i>Foreword</i>	17	4
<i>Feature</i>	3	2
<i>Interview</i>	8	2
<i>News: operations/News: military and covert operations</i>	48	4
<i>Shuhada</i>	6	1
<i>Sisters</i>	18	1
<i>Jointly</i>	151	22

DISCUSSION: THE COMPARISON OF *DABIQ* AND *RUMIYAH* CONTENT

In the IS's propaganda, Turkey is referred to as *tağut* – Muslim country ruled by tyrants. Dualism in the world vision presented by jihadists is omnipresent. It constitutes clear lines of division for members and supporters. In this division, Turkey is classified in the category of: kuffar, evil, infidel, unbeliever *tağut*, supporting Crusader's alliance. According to Micha Bröcklinga, et al. (2018), "Enemy Images" is the most frequently used category of themes mentioned by IS (more than 40%) (Bröcklinga, et al., pp. 261–263).

The basic change that occurred with the release of *Rumiyah* was how IS pictures their enemies. The articles tended to focus on close enemies more often. This is also indicated by the increase in the number of images, and these are the only photos that present references to Turkey. The person who appears in most images is President Erdoğan, often in the company of President Putin. For IS it can have a double meaning. On the one hand, it may indicate a combination of themes of near and distant enemies, and on the other, it may refer to the weakening of transatlantic relations alleged by IS. It can also be a combination of both reasons (used in propaganda together or alternately under appropriate conditions).

The shift of the approach to one of its main close enemies – Turkey, is reflected in the choice of sections. The distribution of words indicates that in *Dabiq* the most popular sections were Article and Feature, while in *Rumiyah* Operations and Article (see Table 5). In the first magazine, the most frequently used section was Article, while in the second Operations. Greater emphasis on depicting Turkey as an enemy was placed in *Rumiyah*. The emphasis correlates with the fall of the quasi-caliphate and the loss of *Dabiq*. When IS was trying to recruit foreign fighters, it paid attention to other enemies, for example, Western states and Russia. *Rumiyah* creators started to use more Operations section, which was basically overlooked in *Dabiq*, in relation to Turkey. The use of Foreword section has also increased, which may indicate that a more general emphasis was placed on fighting Turkey. It is worth highlighting that the increase in keywords in *Rumiyah* (11,26%) occurred in parallel with the decrease in the number of pages. Interesting is also the fact that in the two new sections of *Rumiyah*, Exclusive and Sister, the issues related to Turkey are relatively popular. Furthermore, the topics related to Turkey were more diverse in *Rumiyah*. 8 out of 10 sections (80 %) touched on the subject matter, while in *Dabiq* it was only 9 out of 18 (50%) (see Table 5). Many images were also found in the analyzed magazines. A large part of them pictured President Erdoğan (*Dabiq* – 5, *Rumiyah* – 6). Turkish leader even appeared on the cover of one of *Dabiq* and on the cover photo of *Rumiyah* section (*Dabiq* 11, p. 1, 27). The total number of images in *Rumiyah* increased from 11 to 16 (see Tables 1 and 3).

Table 5. The number of words (Turkey/Turkish, Turk) used in *Dabiq* and *Rumiyah* magazines

Section	Dabiq	Rumiyah
Article	55	41
Enemy's Words/In the Words of the Enemy	15	–
Exclusive	–	10
Foreword/Introduction	0	17
Feature	30	3
History	7	–
Interview	4	8
Operations/Military Operations	1	48
Report	20	–

Table 5. The number... (cont.)

Section	Dabiq	Rumiyah
Shuhada	1	6
Sisters	–	18
Special	1	–
Jointly	134	151

CONTENT PRESENTED IN KONSTANTINIYYE MAGAZINE

The gap between *Dabiq* and *Rumiyah* fills another magazine. In the period of gradual loss of occupied territories, the IS released the Turkish-language magazine. While the majority of the targeted audience live in Turkey, a large number of Turks live in other countries, especially in the EU: Germany, France, Belgium, Holland, and the United Kingdom. IS, recognizing that Turkey plays a crucial role as a bridge between western and eastern societies, tried to take advantage of the sympathies among the Turkish population supportive of the idea of the caliphate. Over time, it also began attacking the state authorities. The release coincided with the annual celebration of the conquest of Constantinople by the Ottomans in 1453, called 'Fetih Gunu' and the national elections (Jihadology, 2015). The title *Konstantiniyye* is related to the rejection of the Ottoman Empire as a legitimate caliphate, as IS blames the Ottomans for establishing a false caliphate and infecting the Muslims with "pagan domes" and "manmade laws" (Dabiq 9, 2016, p. 21; Fuhriman, et al., 2018). *Konstantiniyye*⁵ was published online by Darul Hilafe, an official Turkish-language structure of Al-Hayat Media Center.

Table 6. The issues of *Konstantiniyye* magazine

Issue number	Title	Pages number	Publication date
#1	<i>Fethi [Conquest of Constantinople]</i>	46	June 2015
#2	<i>Hilafet İle Savaşmak Riddet Midir? [Does Fighting the Caliphate Lead to Apostasy?]</i>	60	July 2015
#3	<i>İstişhadi Operasyonların Caizliği Ve Fazileti [Virtue and Lawfulness of Suicide Attacks]</i>	72	September 2015
#4	<i>Sen Onları Birlik Sanırsın, Oysa Kalpleri Paramparçadır [You Think They are Together, but Their Hearts are Divided]</i>	68	November 2015

⁵ *Konstantiniyye* – Constantinople is the old Ottoman name for Istanbul.

Table 6. The issues... (cont.)

Issue number	Title	Pages number	Publication date
#5	<i>Küfredenler İse Tağutun Yolunda Savaşırlar</i> [<i>The Disbelievers Fight in the Way of the Taghut</i>]	56	January 2015
#6	<i>Mürted Kardeşler</i> [Apostate Siblings]	52	April 2016
#7	<i>Küfür Risaleleri</i> [Treatises of Curaders]	60	September 2016

The release of *Konstantiniyye* also coincided with an increase in hostility towards Turkey related to the loss of the town of Tell Abyad to the Kurdish Democratic Union Party (PYD). The city was crucial for military operations, as well as gaining human resources, because between 2013 and 2014 more than a thousand people travelled to Syria through that town. During the Kurdish-led offensive, IS published in Konstantiniyye an article accusing the Turkish authorities of plotting with the PYD to defeat IS (Dodwell, et al., 2016, pp. 25–26).

In the first issue, IS commemorated the fall of Constantinople to the Ottomans with the article entitled *The Conquest of Constantinople*. It is a very efficient propaganda maneuver, because the importance of this event has grown in the recent years in Turkish population. Turkish authorities are investing in promoting this event. They released a production entitled *Fetih 1453*, in February 2012, which was the most expensive movie in Turkish history. IS propaganda did not miss the fact and used excerpts from the movie in Balkan-focused production *Honor in Jihad*. Moreover, the articles seek to tie the conquest with the battle at Dabiq and claim the IS will conquer Rome (Jihadology, 2015). The first issue also presents a poem about Istanbul, articles criticizing democracy (*Democracy was Ignited* and *The Qur'an is for the Dead and Democracy is for Living*), dietary fatwa, targeted against eating meat from animals not slaughtered according to proper Muslim rules, and other informational themes similar to the content of Dabiq and Rumiya (Konstantiniyye 1, 2015).

Issue 1 entitled *Conquest of Constantinople*, focused on gaining followers, did not openly threaten Turkey, although 2 out of 10 articles gave negative arguments towards Turkey (Korkmaz, 2016, p. 13). IS changed its tone as Ankara toughened its approach against salafi-jihadists. Issue 2 entitled *Does Fighting the Caliphate Lead to Apostasy?* referred to the PKK as “the atheist gang, fed by Erdoğan” and called Turkey “the regime of tağut,” “fighting with the support of the American aircraft in Syria and Iraq.” It presented Ankara in a similar tone to the previously discussed magazines, as a state that is trying to confront IS (Konstantiniyye 2, 2015). The third issue, entitled *Virtue and Lawfulness of Suicide Attacks*, like the previous one, presents negative arguments towards Turkey (Korkmaz, 2016, p. 13). Issue 4 was entitled similarly to the article from issue 12 of Dabiq – *Sen Onları Birlik Sanırsın, Oysa Kalpleri Paramparçadır* (You Think They are Together but Their Hearst are Divided) (Konstantiniyye 4, 2015). 2 out of 8 articles in this issue present negative arguments towards Turkey. The issues 5, 6, and 7 each give 1 article with negative arguments (Korkmaz, 2016, pp. 13–14). In issues 6 and 7, Konstantiniyye sharpened its anti-Turkish message, referring to the government and people as infidels: “Today, people, who live under tağut regimes like Turkey and say I’m fulfilling my religious duties, tell lies. Hereof, we advise these people to fear from Allah and immigrate to Islamic State.” (Konstantiniyye 7, 2016, p.13). These issues were released dur-

ing the gradual loss of IS-controlled territories and increased attacks on Turkish bases, mainly near the border towns that serve as an important route for IS migration to Syria (Dodwell, et al., 2016, pp. 25–26).

In contrast to the previously analyzed magazines, *Konstantiniyye* issued between June 2015 and April 2016 published mainly anti-Turkish content and targeted President Erdoğan. The magazine, embedded in the Turkish context, was used as a tool to spread propaganda across Turkish-speaking audience, adapting its content to the local social reality. IS presented its own understanding of religion in accordance with the jihadist ideology. IS tried to inform Turkish-speaking people about its version of Islam, at the same time preventing them from thinking wrongly about its ideology (Gögen, 2018, pp. 147–169; Korkmaz, 2016, p. 14).

CONCLUSIONS

From its beginnings, IS has conducted an aggressive campaign in cyberspace. It has become a global strategy, implemented through various online publications to extend the spectrum of adherents. The research shows that the battle against enemies is going into the realm of the digital space. The media apparatus paid attention not only to the recruitment of Arabic-speaking supporters. They also turned to other recipients by publishing magazines such as *Dabiq*, *Rumiyah*, or *Konstantiniyye*. The above analysis shows that Turkey related topics are popular in the analyzed magazine. IS views Turkey as a Muslim state ruled by tyrants – *tawaghit*, supporting Crusader's alliance, headed by the US. Although the number of keywords was higher in *Rumiyah*, most of the words in one section were used in *Dabiq*. The distribution of keywords indicates that the greater emphasis on portraying Turkey as an enemy was placed in *Rumiyah*. It corresponds to the fall of the self-proclaimed caliphate and the loss of *Dabiq*, a symbolic place for IS. When jihadists were trying to recruit foreign fighters, they paid attention to other enemies, for example, Western states and Russia. Then, propaganda turned to attacks outside the quasi-caliphate, including Turkey. *Rumiyah* started to use more Operations section, which was basically ignored in relation to Turkey in *Dabiq*. The use of Foreword section has also increased, which may indicate that more general emphasis was placed on the problem of fighting Turkey.

In relation to Turkey, the main themes discussed in the analyzed magazines include the following:

- Turkey as part of crusaders' alliance;
- Turkish-Russian relations;
- Turkey as a transit state for jihadi migration (*hijrah*);
- Terrorist attacks in Turkey.

Many of the topics raised in the magazines concerned Turkey as *tağut* and support for US-led alliance against IS. It also applies to parts of Turkish society viewed as apostates (*mur-tadin*), tyrants (*tawaghit*), heretics (*mubdi'een*), members and supporters of apostatic regimes, including Sunni (*Nusayri*), and other infidels (*kufar*) and polytheists (*mushrikeen*) (Hafez, 2010, p. 22). Confirmation of the importance of this topic is the use of the largest number of keywords in a single article in both in *Dabiq* and *Rumiyah* (example: article titled *The Allies of Al-Qā'idah in Shām: Part 4*). Another of the most frequently discussed themes is Turkish-Russian relations. This theme is supported by images presenting Turkish decision-makers, primarily Erdoğan in the company of other enemies, mainly Vladimir Putin. An example is

the Dabiq's article *You Think They are Together but Their Hearts are Divided*. Much space is also devoted to migration, as Turkey is viewed as a transit state for *hijrah*: *Among the Believers are Men: Abu Mujahid al-Faransi*. The last theme refers to terrorist attacks; it describes those that have already occurred and calls for new attacks. The section that is particularly rich in this type of information is Rumiya's News: military and covert operations. This shows a desire to conduct terrorist attacks, but in view of the fact that most of these brought a low number of deaths, it can be considered as a propaganda trick aimed at encouraging to make attacks on Turkish forces. Thus, the content of the analyzed magazines shows that Turkey was constantly seen by the Islamic State's propaganda (from July 2014 to September 2017) as one of the main close enemies.

REFERENCES

- Alazreg, A. A. (2016). *ISIS: Management of Savagery*. Dorrance Publishing Co.
- Alexander, Y. & Alexander, D. (2015). *The Islamic State: Combating the caliphate without borders*. Lexington Books.
- Andersen, J. C., & Sandberg, S. (2020). Islamic State Propaganda: Between Social Movement Framing and Subcultural Provocation. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 32(7), 1506–1526. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09546553.2018.1484356>
- Bröckling, M., Fritsch, C., Haider, M., & Yalman, T. (2018). 'Kill them wherever you find them' – radicalizing narratives of the 'so-called' Islamic State via the online magazine Rumiya. *Journal for Deradicalization*, 19(17), 240–294. <http://journals.sfu.ca/jd/index.php/jd/article/view/180/135>
- Brooke, S. (2010). Strategic fissures: The near and far enemy debate. In A. Moghadam & B. Fishman (Eds.), *Self-inflicted wounds: Debates and division in Al-Qa'ida and its periphery* (pp. 45–68). Combating Terrorism Center. https://ciaotest.cc.columbia.edu/wps/ctc/0020857/f_0020857_17347.pdf
- Cantey, S. (2018). Beyond the Pale? Exploring Prospects for Negotiations with Al Qaeda and the Islamic State. *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*, 41(10), 757–775. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1057610X.2017.1348096>
- Crisis Group. (2016). *The struggle with Islamic State that Turkey hoped to avoid*. Retrieved July 20, 2021, from <https://www.crisisgroup.org/europe-central-asia/western-europemediterranean/turkey/struggle-islamic-state-turkey-hoped-avoid>
- Dabiq. (2014). Issue 1. Retrieved June 10, 2020, from <http://media.clarionproject.org/files/09-2014/isis-isil-islamic-state-magazine-Issue-1-the-return-of-khilafah.pdf>
- Dabiq. (2015). Issue 10. Retrieved June 10, 2021, from <https://jihadology.net/2015/07/13/al-%e1%b8%a5ayat-media-center-presents-a-new-issue-of-the-islamic-states-magazine-dabiq-10/>
- Dabiq. (2015). Issue 11. Retrieved June 10, 2021, from <https://jihadology.net/2015/09/09/al-%e1%b8%a5ayat-media-center-presents-a-new-issue-of-the-islamic-states-magazine-dabiq-11/>
- Dabiq. (2015). Issue 12. Retrieved June 10, 2021, from <https://jihadology.net/2015/11/18/new-issue-of-the-islamic-states-magazine-dabiq-12%e2%80%b3/>
- Dabiq. (2016). Issue 14. Retrieved June 10, 2021, from <https://jihadology.net/2016/04/13/new-issue-of-the-islamic-states-magazine-dabiq-14/>

- Dabiq. (2016). Issue 5. Retrieved June 10, 2021, from <http://www.ieproject.org/projects/dabiq5.pdf>
- Dabiq. (2016). Issue 8. Retrieved June 10, 2021, from <https://jihadology.net/2015/03/30/al-%e1%b8%a5ayat-media-center-presents-a-new-issue-of-the-islamic-states-magazine-dabiq-8/>
- Dabiq. (2016). Issue 9. Retrieved June 10, 2021, from <https://clarionproject.org/docs/isis-islam-islamic-state-magazine-issue+9-they-plot-and-allah-plots-sex-slavery.pdf>
- Dodwell, B., Milton, D., & Ressler, D. (2016). *The caliphate's global workforce: An inside look at the Islamic State's foreign fighter paper trail*. Combatting Terrorism Center. Retrieved April 20, 2021, from <https://www.ctc.usma.edu/posts/the-caliphates-global-workforce-an-inside-look-at-the-islamic-states-foreign-fighter-paper-trail>
- The Economist. (2016, October 29). *Erdogan's war game; Turkey's intervention in Syria and Iraq*. Retrieved November 26, 2022, from <https://www.economist.com/middle-east-and-africa/2016/10/27/erdogans-war-game>
- Fahmy, S. S. (2020). The age of terrorism media: The visual narratives of the Islamic State Group's *Dabiq* magazine. *International Communication Gazette*, 82(3), 260–288. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1748048519843412>
- Fuhriman, C., Medina, R. M., & Brewer, S. (2020). Introducing a Dataset of Multi-Scale Geographies of ISIS Ideology from ISIS Sources. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 34(4), 817–834. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09546553.2020.1742707>
- Gögen, S. (2018). IS-Propaganda in der Türkei: Die Onlinezeitschrift Konstantiniyye: Ein Ein- und Überblick. In W. Hohberger, R. Karadag, K. Müller, & C. Ramm (Eds.), *Grenzübräume, Grenzgänge, Entgrenzungen* (pp. 147–169). Springer Fachmedien Wiesbaden. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-658-20451-8_7
- Guiton, B. (2014, November 7). *ISIS sees Turkey as its ally: Former Islamic State member reveals Turkish Army cooperation*. Newsweek. Retrieved July 19, 2021, from <https://www.newsweek.com/isis-and-turkey-cooperate-destroy-kurds-former-isis-member-reveals-turkish-282920>
- Habeck, M. (2006). *Knowing the enemy: Jihadist ideology and the war on terror*. Yale University Press.
- Hafez, M. M. (2010). Tactics, takfir and anti-Muslim violence. In A. Moghaddan & B. Fishman (Eds.), *Self-inflicted wounds: Debates and division in Al-Qa'ida and its periphery* (pp. 19–44). Combating Terrorism Center. https://ciaotest.cc.columbia.edu/wps/ctc/0020857/f_0020857_17347.pdf
- Hegghammer, T. (2006). Global Jihadism after the Iraq War. *Middle East Journal*, 60(1), 11–32. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4330214>
- Intermedia Education Project. (2019). Retrieved June 10, 2021, from <https://www.ieproject.org/>
- Jihadology (2015). *North Caucasus caucus. 'The conquest of Constantinople: The Islamic State targets a Turkish audience.'* Retrieved July 28, 2020, from <http://jihadology.net/2015/06/09/guest-post-the-conquest-of-constantinople-the-islamic-state-targets-a-turkish-audience/>
- Jihadology. (2019). *New issues of the Islamic State's magazine: Dabiq*. Retrieved July 19, 2020, from <https://jihadology.net/?s=Dabiq>
- Jihadology. (2019). *New magazine issue from The Islamic State: "Constantinople #7"*. Retrieved July 19, 2020, from <https://jihadology.net/?s=konstantiniyye>

- Jihadology. (2019). *New release of the Islamic State's magazine: Rome*. Retrieved July 19, 2020, from <https://jihadology.net/?s=rome>
- Klausen, J. (2015). Tweeting the Jihad: Social Media Networks of Western Foreign Fighters in Syria and Iraq. *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*, 38(1), 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1057610X.2014.974948>
- Konstantiniyye. (2015). Issue 1. Retrieved August 15, 2021, from <https://jihadology.net/2015/06/02/al-%e1%b8%a5ayat-media-center-presents-a-new-magazine-from-the-islamic-state-constantinople-1/>
- Konstantiniyye. (2015). Issue 2. Retrieved August 15, 2021, from <https://jihadology.net/2015/07/21/al-%e1%b8%a5ayat-media-center-presents-a-new-magazine-issue-from-the-islamic-state-constantinople-2/>
- Konstantiniyye. (2015). Issue 4. Retrieved August 15, 2020, from <https://jihadology.net/2015/12/02/new-magazine-issue-from-the-islamic-state-constantinople-4/>
- Konstantiniyye. (2016). Issue 7. Retrieved August 15, 2020, from <https://jihadology.net/?s=constantinople>
- Korkmaz, S. (2016). *Propaganda of terror: Konstantiniyye magazine and the discourse of DAESH* (Report No. 204). ORSAM. <https://icare4all.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/204eng.pdf>
- Lakomy, M. (2019). Danse macabre: Gore images in the Islamic State's 'Dabiq' magazine as a propaganda device. *The International Journal of Intelligence, Security, and Public Affairs*, 21(2), 143–161. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23800992.2019.1649138>
- Lakomy, M. (2020). "One of the Two Good Outcomes": Turning Defeats into Victories in the Islamic State's Flagship Magazine *Rumiyah*. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 32(8), 1712–1730. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09546553.2018.1506335>
- Laqueur, W. (2004). *No end to war: Terrorism in the twenty-first century*. Continuum.
- Minkina, M. (2002). Artykuł 5 Traktatu Waszyngtońskiego. *Wojsko i Wychowanie*, 5, 109–113.
- NATO. (1949, April). The North Atlantic treaty. Retrieved December 2, 2021, from https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natolive/official_texts_17120.htm
- Orzechowski, M. (2016). *Mój sąsiad islamista*. Muza.
- Parlar Dal, E. (2016). Impact of the transnationalization of the Syrian civil war on Turkey: Conflict spillover cases of ISIS and PYD-YPG/PKK. *Cambridge Review of International Affairs*, 29(4), 1396–1420. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09557571.2016.1256948>
- Parlar Dal, E. (2018). The contagion of the Syrian civil war into Turkey under the impact of ISIS and YPG cases: Conditioning factors and diffusion mechanism. In Ö.Z. Oktav, E.D. Parlar & A.M. Kurşun (Eds.), *Violent Non-state Actors and the Syrian Civil War. The ISIS and YPG Cases* (pp. 211–233). Springer.
- Pregill, M. (2016). ISIS, eschatology, and exegesis: The propaganda of Dabiq and the sectarian rhetoric of militant Shi'ism. *Mizan: Journal for the Study of Muslim Societies and Civilizations*, 1(1), 1–36. <http://dx.doi.org/10.17613/y5mz-9v54>
- Rumiyah. (2016). Issue 11. Retrieved June 30, 2021, from <https://azelin.files.wordpress.com/2017/07/rome-magazine-11.pdf>
- Rumiyah. (2017). Issue 13. Retrieved June 30, 2021, from <https://azelin.files.wordpress.com/2017/09/rome-magazine-13.pdf>
- Rumiyah. (2016). Issue 3. Retrieved June 30, 2021, from <https://azelin.files.wordpress.com/2016/11/rome-magazine-3.pdf>

- Rumiyah. (2016). Issue 4. Retrieved June 28, 2021, from <https://azelin.files.wordpress.com/2016/12/rome-magazine-4.pdf>
- Rumiyah. (2017). Issue 5. Retrieved June 28, 2021, from <https://azelin.files.wordpress.com/2017/01/rome-magazine-5.pdf>
- Rumiyah. (2017). Issue 6. Retrieved June 28, 2021, from <https://jihadology.net/2017/02/04/new-release-of-the-islamic-states-magazine-rome-6/>
- Rumiyah. (2017). Issue 7. Retrieved June 28, 2021, from <https://azelin.files.wordpress.com/2017/03/rome-magazine-7.pdf>
- Shaheen, K. (2016, October 16). *Turkish-backed Syrian rebels recapture town of Dabiq from Isis*. The Guardian. Retrieved August 20, 2021, from <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/oct/16/turkish-opposition-fighters-syria-dabiq-islamic-state>
- Sönmez, G. (2019, July). *Turkey's Fight Against ISIS* (Report no. 5). ORSAM. https://orsam.org.tr/d_hbanaliz/turkeys-fight-against-isis.pdf
- Stempień, M. S. (2018). *Państwo Islamskie: nowe oblicze terroryzmu?* Oficyna Wydawnicza Rytm.
- Stempień, M. S. (2021). Russia in the eyes of Islamic State: An analysis of the content of Dabiq and Rumiyah magazines and Russia's involvement in the fight against the Islamic State. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 33(8), 1752–1774. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09546553.2019.1657097>
- Welch, T. (2018). Theology, heroism, justice, and fear: An analysis of ISIS propaganda magazines Dabiq and Rumiyah. *Dynamics of Asymmetric Conflict*, 11(3), 186–198. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17467586.2018.1517943>
- Wignell, P., Tan, S., O'Halloran, K., & Lange, R. (2017). A mixed methods empirical examination of changes in emphasis and style in the extremist magazines Dabiq and Rumiyah. *Perspectives on Terrorism*, 11(2), 2–20.
- Yayla, A. S. & Speckhard, A. (2016). *Aftermath of another ISIS attack in Gaziantep, Turkey: A possible new internal conflict for Turkey*. ICSVE Brief Reports.
- York, R. (2015). *Know the enemy: Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant*. Lulu Press, Inc.
- Zelin, A. Y. (2015). Picture or it didn't happen: A snapshot of the Islamic State's official media output. *Perspectives on Terrorism*, 9(4), 85–97.