ORDINES MILITARES

COLLOQUIA TORUNENSIA HISTORICA Yearbook for the Study of the Military Orders



ISSN (print) 0867-2008 / ISSN (online) 2391-7512

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.12775/OM.2018.019

Ritter, Verwalter und Repräsentanten – Priester und Seelsorger: Burgen, Residenzen und Kirchen des Deutschen Ordens [Knights, Administrators, and Representatives – Priests and Pastors: Castles, Residences, and Churches of the Teutonic Order]. Herausgegeben von Helmut Flachenecker. Quellen und Studien zur Geschichte des Deutschen Ordens 79 = Veröffentlichungen der Forschungsstelle Deutscher Orden an der Universität Würzburg 1. Weimar: vdg, 2016. 192 + 8 pp., 76 maps and illustations. ISBN: 978-3-89739-875-7.

The publication under review is the 79th volume of the series "Quellen und Studien zur Geschichte des Deutschen Ordens." This collection of seven articles serves as the start of a sub-series of publications, published by the "Forschungstelle Deutscher Orden" reseach-center which was opened at the Julius-Maximilian-Universität Würzburg in 2014, and which is the first university institution opened specifically for research on the history of the Teutonic Order in both regional and universal contexts (see the "Vorwort" by Helmut Flachenecker, p. vii). The articles published in this volume are the result of a conference held in Würzburg on 4 July 2014 on the occasion of the opening of the Forschungstelle.

The articles are preceded by a foreword by Flachenecker (pp. vii–viii) as well as a highly informative article by Helmut Flachenecker and Monika Riemer which sketches out the circumstances which led to the forming of the Forschungsstelle ("Die Forschungsstelle Deutscher Orden an der Universität Würzburg," pp. 1–3). The final part of the introduction is a text by Udo Arnold ("Ritter, Verwalter und Repräsentanten – Priester und Seelsorger: Burgen, Residenzen und Kirchen des Deutschen Ordens," pp. 5–8) which emphasizes the regional and universal dimensions of the Teutonic Order's history. At the end of the volume, there is a useful list of geographical places and persons, prepared by Katharine Kemmer and Mareile Mansky (pp. 185–192).

The first article, by Hubert Houben, is devoted to the buildings of the Teutonic Order in the Mediterranean ("Bauten des Deutschen Ordens im Mittelmeerraum (12.–15. Jahrhundert)," pp. 9–30). Houben describes a set of chosen buildings in southern Italy (mostly Apulia – pp. 9–17), Sicily (pp. 17–20), and in the Holy Land (pp. 26–30). Apart from the summary of over 20 buildings located in these regions, he also discusses a couple of issues analyzed in previous decades, such as the hypothesis that the Castel del Monte was supposedly the mausoleum of Hermann von Salza (pp. 9–10), the completely unsupported assumption of the

existence of a fortified road from Andria to Castel del Monte (p. 10), or ascribing the foundation of the Augustinian church in Barletta (Sant'Agostino), where Hermann von Salza supposedly was to be buried, to the Teutonic Order (p. 15). Houben also expresses his doubts about a hypothesis often postulated in the literature concerning the similarity of the Teutonic Order's castle in La Mota in Castille to Clermont castle near Chlemouts in the Peloponnese (pp. 22, 25). He presents an argument against treating the castle of Montfort, located in Palestine, as the head-quarters of the Order, and he agrees with Klaus Militzer that the castle was in a dependent relation to Acre (p. 29). Houben consciously decides to avoid discussing the buildings of the Order in Cilician Armenia, Cyprus, and Greece (p. 26), as well as the Languedoc, Provence, and central and northern Italy.

The second article, written by Christofer Herrmann, "Kloster – Burg – Residenz. Der Hochmeisterpalast auf der Marienburg im Kontext der Burgenarchitektur des Deutschen Ordens in Preußen," pp. 31-57, presents the initial premises of a research project focusing on the so called "Palace of the Grand Masters" ("Hochmeisterpalast") in Malbork. The reseach project was conducted by Herrmann at the Technische Universität Berlin in the years 2015–2018. The project aims to reconsider the structure (morphology), functionality, architectural style, and typology of the monumental residence. The author claims that, compared to other buildings of this type in Europe, the Palace of the Grand Masters is one of the most modern residential buildings of the time (p. 37). As there are no unequivocal written records concering the architectural structure of the building, Herrmann constructs a hypothetical functional profile, taking into account the needs of the grand master and his closest associates (who played a role similar, to some extent, to that of a monarch's court), as well as the layout of the rooms which is largely original (pp. 40-41). This is a legitimate method, but the results of analyses based on this can only be hypothetical; the author is aware of this.

A major section of the second article is devoted to a detailed analysis of the rooms located on the four levels of the residence; they are all analyzed in terms of specific functional units (p. 41). Going from the lower level up they are (despite Herrmann's surprising numbering from above): level I – cellars; level II – chancery and archives; level III – living quarters of the dignitaries and prelates who served as the grand master's advisors; level IV – living quarters of the grand master, rooms where larger bodies of people could gather, and reception rooms to greet important visitors. The proposed functions of the building levels does not raise any issues (for example Herrmann argues that the chancery rooms were located on level II (or level III in his terms: p. 51). However, his functional layout of individual rooms on these floors requires a lot of attention and will surely give rise to much discussion, for example, his proposed location of the chamber of the grand mas-

ter's chaplain (III 1b), based on the mention that the latter's work was carried out near the furnace that heated the winter refectory which, supposedly, adjoined this room (p. 52). He locates the armory of the grand master in one of the rooms of level I (according to the author's scheme this is level IV, so the location is IV 2, p. 55); this seems unconvincing, considering that the sources suggest that the large number of arms and armor kept in it which would require a much larger space.¹

Herrmann's analysis also contains some inaccuracies: for example, some of the chambers marked on level III (Herrmann's level II), specifically chambers II 1a, II 1b, II 1c, II 1d, do not fit the description provided on page 50; chambers IV 2a-d are also incorrectly marked as they should be marked as II 4a-d. Herrmann emphasizes the comfort of the living quarters in the "Palace of the Grand Masters," particularly due to the good planning and layout of the stairs and the *hypocaustum* based heating system (pp. 55–56). He also argues that the architecture was coherent in terms of style and formed a "perfect symbiosis" of aesthetics and functionality (p. 57). The publication of a monograph presenting the entirety of Herrmann's research on this topic is planned for 2019.

The third article, by Ilgvars Misāns, presents an overview written in a highly essayist style of the buildings owned by the Teutonic Order in Livonia ("Deutschordensburgen in Livland," pp. 59-76). Misāns characterizes around 60 buildings and points out that, due to the lack of political hegemony in this region, the castles of the Teutonic Order were not only important in protecting the region from outside attack but also served an important role during internal Livonian conflicts (p. 60). Misans also emphasizes the importance of rivers as ways of communication, and the Order construced a number of keeps alongside them, for example Düna (Lat. Daugava, Rus. Western Dvina), Livländische Aa (Lat. Gauja), Kurländische Aa (Lat. Lielupe), and Windau (Lat. Venta) (pp. 61, 63). The author provides examples of how the significance of a number of these defensive structures changed over time, for example Wolkenburg (today: Mākoņkalns) (pp. 63-64). These changes were usually caused by the construction of new castles, by settlement, or by administrative changes. While Misans follows the argument of Friedrich Benninghoven about the standardized type of Teutonic Order's castles in Prussia and Livonia, he points out that the Livonian castles were less unified in terms of morphology (pp. 66, 68).2 He also emphasizes the fact that the construc-

Sławomir Jóźwiak and Janusz Trupinda locate this armory at level IV in the chamber referred to by Ch. Herrmann as I 5b, see Sławomir Jóźwiak and Janusz Trupinda, *Organizacja życia na zamku krzyżackim w Malborku w czasach wielkich mistrzów (1309–1457)* (Malbork: Muzeum Zamkowe, 2011, 2nd edition), 220–221. The author does not argue with this proposal at all.

This is not the original view of the author; similarly, just earlier, Marian Arszyński, "Średniowieczne budownictwo warowne na obszarze Inflant," in *Inflanty w średniowieczu. Władztwa*

tion of castles was very dynamic, and rather than being conceived of as very 'static' objects, they should be treated as architectural objects under constant revision (p. 70). Finally, the author points out that, in the last few years, there has been a change in the way the Latvian and Estonian populations are perceiving the Teutonic Order's castles located in their regions, as they now increasingly view them as integral elements in the historical tradition of both countries (pp. 64, 66, 76).

The final four articles focus on the buildings constructed by the Order in the Holy Roman Empire, mostly in Franconia. Dieter J. Weiß ("Die Ballei Franken," pp. 77–91) presents the Franconian bailiwick which contained around 20 houses of the Order. This is an overview of the most important of the Order's commanderies in this region, particularly Virnsberg, Nümberg, Regensburg, and Rothenburg. While Weiß focuses on the medieval period, he also discusses the abolishment of the Order's buildings in this region in 1809 (p. 91). This overview is mostly based on the author's own research, which he published in 1991. Weiß emphasizes a lack of unity in the way the commanderies were build, and their diversity, both in terms of their organization (for example, some commanderies were manned by brother priests as "Priesterkommenden," pp. 85–86), and in terms of their architecture.

The next article, by Maike Trentin-Meyer, is dedicated to the Order's house in Mergentheim, which also belonged to the Franconian bailiwick ("Residenz Mergentheim. Ihre Baugeschichte und ihre Bedeutung für den Deutschen Ordens," pp. 93–131). Trentin-Meyer describes the history of this commandery, beginning with its establishment in 1219 up to its abolishment in 1809. The main focus of the overview are architectural issues. The author mostly focuses on the early-modern period, when, in 1525, the commandery became the seat of the land master of the Order in the Holy Roman Empire. After 1527, the land master was also the administrator on behalf of the grand master. Trentin-Meyer discusses the substantial building activities, begun in 1568 and carried out until the beginning of the 17th century, as a result of which the medieval commandery was transformed into a Renaissance residence (pp. 97–102). The second phase of intensive construction work at the site took place in the early 18th century and continued until the 1730s

zakonu krzyżackiego i biskupów, ed. Marian Biskup (Toruń: Wydawnictwo Naukowe UMK, 2002), 75, 77 and 79 (new version: "Zamki i umocnienia zakonu krzyżackigo i biskupów w Inflantach," in Zakon krzyżacki w Prusach i Inflantach. Podziały administracjne i kościelne w XIII–XVI wieku, ed. Roman Czaja and Andrzej Radzimiński, Dzieje Zakonu Niemieckiego II (Toruń: Wydawnictwo Naukowe UMK, 2013), 184–185); cf. English version: "Medieval Fortiefied Architecture in Livonia," in The Teutonic Order in Prussia and Livonia. The Political and Ecclesiastical Structures 13th–16th C., ed. Roman Czaja and Andrzej Radzimiński (Toruń: Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu / Köln–Weimar–Wien: Böhlau, 2015), 199–201.

(pp. 102–106). Trentin-Meyer discusses the question of the motivations behind the re-building and expansion of the complex. She suggests that the reason was the representative significance of the commandery since the 13th century when it was the place where the Order's land masters and grand masters sometimes stayed, as well as the location of at least two grand chapters (pp. 95, 109). She notices that there was no attempt to rebuild the Renaissance building into a Baroque palace, and she claims that this was due to the fact that the Order decided to avoid architectural splendor and pomp (p. 131). The Renaissance residence in Mergentheim was composed architecturally in such a way that the adjacent city was also connected to its representational form. It distinguished itself by its vastness rather than decorativeness and unusual stylistics, and because of this it was quite different from the Baroque palaces constructed by the Empire's secular princes and important clergy. The building was intended to serve administrative purposes connected with the office of the administrator of the grand master in Prussia and the land master of the Holy Empire, as well as governance of the local commandery at the center of a large territory (pp. 129, 131).

The following article, "Die Landkommende Ellingen" (pp. 133-153), by Wolfgang Wüst, focuses on another commandery, the Order's house in Ellingen. It was the main commandery of the Franconian bailiwick. Wüst also considers the architectural aspect of this building complex in the early-modern era. Ellingen served as the residence of the land commanders of Franconia (it was rebuilt into a Baroque palace in 1718-1724). The author focuses on the spiritual function of the Order's lands in 16th-18th century Franconia. He argues that the whole iconographic program of the residence emphasized this aspect of the presence of the Order in Ellingen (p. 133). Wüst questions the critical assessment of early-modern clerical dominions, which was a dominant view in older historiography and originates in the Enlightenment period. In his discussion of this issue, he refers to the example of Johann Pezzl, 1756–1823, (pp. 141–145). He argues that the Order's commandery in Ellingen was in a good state, and that the fact that the architects working on its expansion used Italian inspirations is good evidence of this (p. 145). The early-modern properties of the Order in Ellingen are depicted in the Ellingische Polliceÿ Ordnung de Anno 1685, which Wüst carefully analyzes (pp. 148-151). Despite various problems, for example the witch trials (which took place in Ellingen since 1575), life of the subjects in the Order's lands around Ellingen did not differ much from the lives of the subjects of secular lords (p. 152).

The last article in the volume is a study by Stefan Kummer, dedicated to the beginnings of the commandery in Würzburg ("Vom Königshof zur Deutschordens-Komturei in Würzburg," pp. 155–184). It is the most analytical text in the whole volume. It is based on the results of partial architectural and archaeologi-

cal studies in the area of the tower of the Gothic church belonging to the commandery, as well as on an analysis of written and iconographic sources. It brings to light a number of new observations with regard to the functioning of this commandery, from the time of its establishment (1219/1224) until the early 14th century. The commandery was constructed in place of an old Staufen royal manor (pp. 156-160) which had a chapel (identified by the author hypothetically as the chapel of St. Mary which is mentioned in a document from 1226) (pp. 164, 168, 172). In the 1230s, the chapel was rebuilt, this time with a multi-leveled Romanesque tower (pp. 163–164, 173). As the Order's house in Würzburg grew and developed, the tower chapel could no longer serve the sacral and representative needs of the commandery; thus, in the 1270s, construction began on a new church. The new church (pp. 173-177) was built in two stages (divided by a conflict about a road crossing between the church and the tower, which ended in 1296). At the beginning of the 14th century, its vertical shape, which had been built in the Gothic style, was completed. In the 1280s, work on the reconstruction the commander's quarters and the monastic house began. An illustration from the chronicle of the bishops of Würzburg from 1546 gives us some knowledge of how this part of the commandery (along with some domestic buildings) and the church appeared in the late medieval period (pp. 160, 180-181). Kummer's study provides us with new perspectives on the dynamics of the architectural changes that took place in the commandery in Würzburg in its early stages in the 13th century; it also indicates its significant investment capabilities in the final quarter of that century, which is expressed by the construction of the monumental church in a new style which was not known in Würzburg at the time. This was only possible through hiring of a building workshop from the regions of the middle or upper Rhine (p. 180).

Overall, this volume should be assessed very favorably. It clearly shows the regional diversity of the Teutonic Order, especially in terms of building activities, and in some cases also in terms of architecture. It also shows how this diversity was affected by local factors and (more or less temporary) conditions. The publication is made attractive by the substantial number of visual and cartographic material, attached to all seven articles (taken together, a total of 76 illustrations, plans, and maps). Thus, this collection represents important research which is part of a current trend of studying how the Teutonic Order functioned on a local and regional level, while also helping us to understand it in its broader institutional context.

Krzysztof Kwiatkowski (Toruń)*

^{*} ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1827-3122