

The Military Orders. Vol. 6.1, Culture and Conflict in the Mediterranean World, and Vol. 6.2, Culture and Conflict in Western and Northern Europe. Edited by Jochen Schenk and Mike Carr. London–New York: Routledge/Taylor & Francis, 2017. 228 and 241 pp. ISBN: 978-1-4724-7635-7 and 978-1-4724-7638-8.

2017 saw the publication of a new two-part volume of *The Military Orders: Proceedings of the London Centre for the Study of the Crusades, the Military Religious Orders and the Latin East* series, first launched in 1994 (originally printed by Ashgate, now under the auspices of Routledge/Taylor & Francis). The forty articles included in this two-part collection were first presented during the sixth conference held at the Museum of the Order of St. John, St. John's Gate, Clerkenwell, in London in September 2013, where a total number of nearly a hundred papers was presented.² The division of the volume by geography into the Mediterranean area (Syria, Palestine, Cyprus, Rhodes, Malta) and Northern and Western Europe is supposed "to provide the reader with the broadest overview of the most current research in the field of military order studies relating to their military lives and culture" (6.1, p. xv), the latter being explored in its multifaceted meanings, as Jochen Schenk and Mike Carr indicate in their "Editors' Preface."

Both parts of the volume are preceded by short notes on the authors, the editors' preface, and introductions by the late Jonathan Riley-Smith; both end with general indexes. The volumes' layout is logical and clear. The two parts of the book have almost equal page numbers (228 pp. and 241 pp.), although the first part comprises two articles more (twenty-one in 6.1 to nineteen in 6.2). Thematically, the vast majority of the articles discusses the Knights Hospitaller: together with the articles on the Order of Malta, the number amounts to sixteen in the first, Mediterranean part, and eight in the second part of the volume. At second place is the Order of the Temple with five articles, a number that could have been larger had more conference participants decided to publish their findings. Other military orders are barely represented: three articles deal with the Teutonic Knights (including their Protestant branch in Utrecht) and two with Iberian orders (Aviz and Santiago), while the remaining six concern the military orders in general or address two orders from a com-

² The conference programme: *The Military Orders: Culture and Conflict. 6th International Conference 5th-8th September 2013*, London Centre for the Study of the Crusades, the Military Religious Orders and the Latin East, last modified 27 September 2013, accessed 5 April 2018, <https://docs.google.com/file/d/0B6WA2UEsksrKREduVW1jTjRMTFE/edit>.

parative angle. Alas, contrary to what one may expect considering the title of the series, no other military orders are represented in this volume.

The majority of the studies collected in this two-part volume is of a micro-historical character. Although the topics discussed by the researchers are certainly valuable for experts, their quite narrow and hermetic thematic scope may be a challenge for historians of other fields. The volume contains only very few texts that either consider long-term processes, or refer to the problems and concepts that have been the subject of more general studies. Noteworthy is the fact that certain articles apply new methodological approaches and interdisciplinary inspirations, which successfully allows the authors to formulate new theses and reach new results. What can be considered a disadvantage is the lack of linguistic proofreading; as a result, an attentive reader will notice some evident oversights (e.g., 6.1, p. 111, v. 2) and several grammatical and lexical typos and mistakes (e.g., 6.1, p. 106, first sentence; 6.2, p. 204, v. 4; p. 205, map).

Part 6.1 starts with an article by Anthony Luttrell on the papal privilege of 1113 for the Hospitallers in Jerusalem. The author provides an overview of the circumstances of the issuing of this privilege and a source analysis. This insightful study draws attention to the role of the privilege in the more general process of the development of a new kind of Order as well as a new model of relations between a religious institution and a territorial authority.

Sebastián Salvadó, in his article “Reflections of conflict in two fragments of the liturgical observances from the primitive rule of the Knights Templar,” reflects on the chapters in the Templar rule that specify feasts and celebrations mandatory for Templar Knights. Salvadó argues that, following the loss of Jerusalem, the Templars abandoned the elements of the liturgy commemorating the liberation of the Holy City, thereby severing ecclesiastical ties with the Patriarchate of Jerusalem. It would have been advantageous, though, if the author had decided to put forward his opinion on the reasons for this new distance.

The third article by Kevin James Lewis examines the etymology of Arabic terms describing military knights and their possible interpretation. The author discusses predominantly the Western research on how the military orders are presented in Arabic primary sources; the actual “Islamic views of the military orders” promised in the title are considered in the second part of the article where Lewis analyzes a number of Levantine Muslim records. The core problem is the attitude of Saladin toward these knights, which, as the author believes, was negative due to their ability to attract Muslims to Christianity. The issue of the portrayal of the military orders in the Muslim records is also tackled by Betty Binysh in her text “Massacre or mutual benefit: The military orders’ relations with their Muslim neighbours in the Latin East (1100–1300)”. Binysh’s reflections focus on primary sources from the second half of

the 12th and the 13th centuries, particularly on Saladin's attitude toward Templars and Hospitallers, while the earliest evidence of these relations dates back to the 1130s; hence, the chronological scope in the article's title should have been narrowed. Similarly to Lewis, though from a slightly different angle, Binysh points out the key role of the view on the military orders in the development of Saladin's propaganda.

Stephen Bennett, in "The battle of Arsuf/Arsur, a reappraisal of the charge of the Hospitallers," reinterprets the accounts of the battle of 1191, paying particular attention to two commanders of the rearguard in King Richard's army, namely the marshal of the Hospitaller Order and Baldwin le Carron. According to the author, the charge of the rearguard was not so much "a failure in discipline," as it was "a rare glimpse of how a medieval general might decentralise command to trusted subordinates to act in accordance with his overall intent." However, the decision to delegate the duties to particular military commanders does not automatically eliminate the possibility of the commanders' acting against the will of the army general; hence, the two should not be contrasted as mutually exclusive.

In the sixth article of the volume, referring to the organization of financial resources for the Fifth Crusade, Thomas W. Smith poses the question whether making Templar institutions responsible for the twentieth tax may be deemed "[a] culture of papal preference." The author indicates the possible reasons why the Hospitallers, although having a similar financial infrastructure, were not entrusted with this task. He also raises the problem of the lack of advanced research on the Hospitaller Order as an international banking institution.

Karol Polejowski's article is the seventh chapter of volume 6.1. The author focuses on the Frankish nobility's activities along the southern border during Emperor Frederick II's involvement in the East. In his analysis, the author pays particular attention to the role of Walter of Brienne in organizing border defenses between Caesarea, Jaffa, and Jerusalem, and maintaining the Franks' possessions along the southern frontier of the Latin kingdom. To a lesser extent, the text indicates the role of the Knights Templar in these endeavours.

The article by Vardit Shotten-Hallel is one of several texts in this volume which undertake the analysis of architecture associated with the military orders. Shotten-Hallel reconstructs the appearance of the Hospitallers' buildings in Acre and their impact on the town's public places. Furthermore, the author focuses on the way urban space was used in ceremonies and rituals practiced by the Hospitallers, providing some very insightful conclusions. The volume's further contributions on Hospitaller architecture come from an art historian and an archaeologist. Gil Fishhof argues that the mural cycle of the Church of the Resurrection at Abu-Ghosh "expresses specific Hospitaller notions and concerns," being an element of "the Order's attempts to increase its fame and importance in the Latin

Kingdom around the 1170s" (6.1, p. 83). The chapter's argumentation is based on several legendary accounts and their probable impact on the Order's ethos; the author also refers to older research on the political ambitions of the Knights Hospitaller. Anna Takoumi discusses and compares the iconographical programs of the Hospitallers in Western and Eastern art, particularly their ideological dimensions. Though the conclusion is perhaps a little evasive, the article is very informative.

A very interesting article by Nicholas Coureas investigates the acts of manumission of Hospitaller slaves in Rhodes and Cyprus in the fifteenth century, considering their origins, confession, age, and sex. As the author notes, additional research is advisable in order to determine the further lives of the manumitted people. It is also difficult to state particular patterns or regularities as far as the analyzed manumissions are concerned.

James Petre, in the article "Back to Baffes: 'A Castle in Cyprus attributed to the Hospital?' revisited," reconsiders the previous research on the eponymous Baffes castle, pointing to new arguments based on the analysis of written records, architectural remains, and the site of the castle. It is not an attempt of the author to resolve the issue of the building's ownership; rather, he aims at providing new data and new questions for future discussion.

The following four articles shed new light on the activities of the Hospitallers on Rhodes. Michael Heslop's article "Hospitaller statecraft in the Aegean: Island polity and mainland power?" speculates on possible directions for the expansion of the Hospitallers of Rhodes during the fourteenth century. Despite the scarce source material, Heslop considers various options for the Hospitaller Order's foreign policy during the fourteenth century, employing geopolitical analysis. The author's points are illustrated with maps and photographs of the places under study. Pierre Bonneaud's article discusses the Hospitallers' internal affairs during the fifteenth century, with particular emphasis on peace-maintaining strategies and episodes of conflicts and their resolution. Emma Maglio, in her article, employs an analysis of the town and building plans into the research on the Hospitallers' sacred places and properties on Rhodes, the Order's capital since the early fourteenth century. Equipped with maps and a detailed typology of church plans, the article could be an excellent starting point for investigating "the wider urban policies of the Order on Rhodes" (6.1, p. 155). Gregory O'Malley, who specializes in the English language of the Order, applies linguistic analysis to offensive expressions used by the Knights Hospitaller in relation to the Ottoman Turks. From his study, which covers over a hundred years, one could deduce that the Hospitallers' way of addressing all sorts of enemies of the Christian faith was a rather consistent element of the Order's self-presentation and may have been more aggressive whenever the Order required help from Western powers.

As Jonathan Riley-Smith notes in the introduction, among the forty texts, only a small percentage is devoted to early-modern times. The article by Anne Brogini may be considered a signal in this regard. In her study, “Crisis and revival: The convent of the Order of Malta during the Catholic Reformation (16th–17th centuries),” Brogini makes a successful attempt to trace the process of change in the cultural life of the Order of Malta. Her findings from the source analysis of the Malta Codex are illustrated by very informative charts and tables. The article ends with the conclusion that the Order of Malta, during the Reformation, undertook an internal reform that resulted in its strengthening. It is worth adding that the functioning of the military orders during the Reformation or their reforms during earlier periods were discussed during the 18th Ordines Militares conference, the results of which were also published in 2017 in the OMCTH Yearbook.

The eighteenth article in the volume, “The Hospitallers and the Grand Harbour of Malta: Culture and Conflict” by Emanuel Buttigieg, fits in with the research on self-presentation and the normalization of social life. The author points not only to the harbor’s economic role for modernity, but also to how it was used in the Order’s ceremonies. To this end, he uses methodologies developed by the social and cultural sciences. Another article, which also discusses the social practices in the Order of Malta in the modern period, is the one by Theresa Vella. Vella focuses her attention on the buildings of the Magistral Palace where the members of the order, namely the grand masters, used to practice personal piety, and which also served as places of public religious ceremonies.

Early modern ways of maintaining sanitary standards are the subject of a study by Victor Mallia-Milanes, who tackles the issue of epidemic prevention measures on Malta and in Venice. Although the often contrary practices and ordinances regarding sanitary restrictions caused conflicts between the Venetians and the Order of Malta, they did not, as the author proves, translate into their political decisions regarding activities against the Ottoman Turks.

The first part of volume 6.1 ends with the article “Censoring the Hospitallers: The failed attempt at re-printing Ferdinando de Escaño’s *Propugnaculum Hierosolymitanum* in Malta in 1756” by William Zammit. The author describes the issue of the prohibition of a publication in the political and cultural context of early-modern Malta, indicating at the same time that such prohibitions were not frequent, and that the one under study should be treated as a touchstone for the situation of Hospitallers in the mid-18th century.

The article by Nikolas Jaspert, launching the second part of the volume (6.2), was the opening lecture at the 2013 conference. The text refers to the ongoing discussion on the concept of frontier in historical research. Jaspert makes an attempt to analyze linguistically the meaning of the term in the languages of the sourc-

es and the historical meta-languages, e.g. English, German and other European languages; he then proceeds to discuss various concepts of frontier perception in current scholarship, pointing out six ways of interpreting the term and considering the possibility of their application in the research on the military orders and crusader states. Correspondingly, the article by Philippe Josserand also raises the problem of the frontier, stressing the historiographical burden of the term. The territory analyzed in Josserand's text is the Christian-Muslim frontier on the Iberian peninsula, where the fourteenth-century military activity of the Santiago Order has been, according to the author, an neglected field of study.

The following two articles are inspired methodologically by the new cultural history. The paper by Xavier Baecke, "The symbolic power of spiritual knight-hood: Discourse and context of the donation of Count Thierry of Alsace to the Templar Order in the county of Flanders," goes beyond the mere analysis of the donation document and its political and social background, considering it also as a means to demonstrate ideology and instil ideas. Damien Carraz's "'Segnoría', 'memoria', 'controversia': Pragmatic literacy, archival memory, and conflicts in Provence (twelfth and thirteenth century)" takes a look at charters, which he examines as a new type of documents, developed in 12th-century Provence and first used to formalize the relations between the local communities and two military orders, namely the Templars and the Hospitallers. According to Carraz, the three components listed in the title of his article occur in each charter and should be considered when studying these documents.

The volume also has a source edition. Karl Borchardt's "Conflicts and codices: The example of Clm 4620, a collection about the Hospitallers" is related to the theme of the volume. It contains, besides the text, an analysis of its context and purpose.

The ambiguous title of the next article, "'Maligno spiritu ductus et sue professionis immemor': Conflicts within the culture of the Hospitaller Order on Rhodes and Cyprus" by Simon Phillips may not fully reflect the actual content of the text. Based on an analysis of Maltese archival documents, the author focuses on offenses against the rule of the Hospitallers, committed by the brothers in the late Middle Ages, citing various examples of misconduct. However, despite what the author seems to suggest, it is hardly surprising for a medievalist that sodomy was more severely punished than adultery.

"Ad celebrandum divina: Founding and financing perpetual chantries at Clerkenwell priory, 1242–1404" begins a series of three articles of volume 6.2 that are dedicated to the English Hospitallers. In her text, Nicole Hamonic investigates the economic situation of the Clerkenwell Hospitallers and presents two examples of how the harsh financial situation might have resulted in complaints and conflicts within the Order. Christie Majoros-Dunnahoe, in "Through the local lens:

Re-examining the function of the Hospitallers in England,” on the basis of available sources tries to identify all sorts of the Order’s activities. She also makes an accurate observation of how the perception of the influence of the Hospitallers on the cultural landscape of England may change when smaller and seemingly less important houses are taken into account. The third, well-structured article by Anthony M. J. Lombardo Delarue, “The use of the double-traversed cross in the English priory of the Order of Saint John of Jerusalem,” meticulously presents the forms and ways of usage of this cross not only in England, but also in other places in Western Europe. Apart from that, the author examines its symbolism and indicates its impact on the spiritual life of the Hospitallers.

Helen J. Nicholson’s article “The Templars’ estates in the west of Britain in the early fourteenth century” summarizes the state of research on the Order of the Temple in its most critical period, namely on the eve of its dissolution. Nicholson discusses several English and Welsh Templar territories in terms of their sources of income, expenses, and personnel.

Julia Baldó Alcoz’s article “Defensive elements in the architecture of Templar and Hospitaller preceptories in the priory of Navarre” raises an interesting problem. However, while her description of places, buildings, and architectural details is accurate and informative, one may challenge the validity of her paragraph on the ideology and symbolism of architecture. The methodological background is presented quite superficially, and the author does not refer to the existing literature of the subject. Moreover, the actual attempts to decipher the ideological meaning of the architectural elements are barely noticeable in the text. It would also be advisable to attach an isometric map of the area under study.

In the article “The commander of Noudar of the Order of Avis in the border with Castile: History and memory,” Luis Adão da Fonseca and Maria Cristina Pimenta present the findings of their research project launched in 2009. The authors refer to their studies on the border and frontier areas. Their primary focus is on the way the population of the region psychologically responded to the changes of rulers and altered borderlines, and on the role of the Order of Avis in this process.

Paula Pinto Costa and Lúcia Maria Cardoso Rosas very interestingly explore the symbolical and ideological dimension of the Portugal commandery of the Hospitallers. In their article “Vera Cruz de Marmelar in the XIIIth–XVth centuries: A St John’s commandery as an expression of cultural memory and territorial appropriation,” they examine the role of the relic of the True Cross in the creation of the Order’s ideology and reinforcement of authority. They also advocate a view that Vera Cruz de Marmelar and Flor da Rosa were supposed to symbolically resemble Jerusalem and Rhodes respectively. By these means, “the Order assumed

a rhetorical cycle, reinforcing its identity and justifying its role in the historical scenario of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries” (6.2, pp. 169–170).

The Knights Templar and Knights Hospitallers in their Italian setting are the topic of Mariarosaria Salerno’s article. Salerno examines the relationships between the Italians and the members of the Orders. The findings, dependent on the content of the available source material, inform mainly on various donations, transactions, as well as contracts and conflicts between the Knights and the Italian population, as well as other religious institutions.

Elena Bellomo’s study of the endeavours of the Hospitallers in Italy pertains to a later period (namely the second half of the 15th century). Bellomo’s interests lie with the relations between the Knights Hospitallers of Lombardy and the most influential of the nobility of the period – the papacy and the Sforza family. The author unambiguously negatively assesses the Sforzas’ and the Papacy’s interference in the internal affairs of the Order.

Of the remaining four articles, three are dedicated to the history of the Teutonic Order. Conradin von Planta, in his article, tackles the functioning of two forms of jurisdiction in a territory inhabited by the Teutonic Knights in the 13th and 14th centuries, namely advocacy and ‘defensio’ in the broad geographical scope of the Upper Rhineland. The text introduces several examples of the use of both forms and their practical outcomes. Another article, “The role of the legend of Saint Barbara’s head in the conflict of the Teutonic Order and Świętopelk, the duke of Pomerania” by Maria Starnawska, discusses the versions of the legend, the genesis of their development and, in accordance with the title, their role in the political activity and ethos of both the Order and the Pomeranian Duke.

The fluctuations among the modern European nobility and their impact on the social composition of the Order of St. John are investigated by Anton Caruana Galizia in the eighteenth text of the second part. Although the author emphasizes the necessity of further studies, his findings so far indicate that the attitude of the nobility towards the Hospitallers’ tradition was exceptional in comparison to the attitude toward other military orders.

The last article, and also the only one regarding the 19th century, is Renger E. de Bruin’s study on “The narrow escape of the Teutonic Order Bailiwick of Utrecht, 1811–1815.” This well-structured paper focuses on Napoleon’s decree of February 27, 1811, on the dissolution of the Teutonic Order in the Protestant city. The author presents the reasons for the decision on the dissolution, the process of its implementation and reaction to it, and its outcomes.

*Anna Maleszka (Toruń)**

* ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2338-6554>