

ORDINES MILITARES
COLLOQUIA TORUNENSIA HISTORICA
Yearbook for the Study of the Military Orders

vol. XVII (2012)



Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

EDITORIAL BOARD

Roman Czaja, Editor in Chief, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń
Jürgen Sarnowsky, Editor in Chief, University of Hamburg

Jochen Burgtorf, California State University
Sylvain Gouguenheim, École Normale Supérieure Lettres et Sciences Humaines de Lyon
Hubert Houben, Università del Salento Lecce
Alan V. Murray, University of Leeds
Krzysztof Kwiatkowski, Assistant Editor, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń

REVIEWERS:

Darius von Guettner, School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, University of Melbourne
Sławomir Józwiak, Institute of History and Archival Sciences, Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń
Tomasz Jurek, Institute of History of Polish Academy of Sciences
Juhan Kreem, City Archives of Tallinn
Johannes A. Mol, Institute for History, University Leiden
Maria Starnawska, Institute of History, Jan Długosz University in Częstochowa
Sławomir Zonnenberg, Institute of History and International Relationships, Kazimierz Wielki University in Bydgoszcz

ADDRESS OF EDITORIAL OFFICE:

Instytut Historii i Archiwistyki UMK, ul. Gagarina 9
87-100 Toruń
e-mail: rc@umk.pl
juergen.sarnowsky@uni-hamburg.de

Subscriptions orders should be addressed to:
books@umk.pl

Printed in Poland

© Copyright by Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
© Copyright by Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

ISSN 0867-2008

NICOLAUS COPERNICUS UNIVERSITY PRESS

EDITORIAL OFFICE: ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

tel. (0) 56 611 42 95, fax (0) 56 611 47 05

e-mail: wydawnictwo@umk.pl

DISTRIBUTION: ul. Reja 25, 87-100 Toruń

tel./fax (0) 56 611 42 38

e-mail: books@umk.pl

www.wydawnictwoumk.pl

First edition

Print: Nicolaus Copernicus University Press
ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

CONTENTS

I. STUDIES AND ARTICLES FROM THE 16TH ORDINES MILITARES CONFERENCE

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>Philippe Josserand</i> (Nantes) Grenze(n) und geistliche Ritterorden in der lateinischen Welt des Mittelalters | 7 |
| <i>Damien Carraz</i> (Clermont-Ferrand) <i>Sub eiusdem pacis et treugue Dei defensione</i> . Die Ritterorden und der Frieden in Südfrankreich im 12. Jahrhundert | 17 |
| <i>Alan Forey</i> (Kirtlington) The Participation of the Military Orders in Truces with Muslims in the Holy Land and Spain during the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries | 41 |
| <i>Shlomo Lotan</i> (Ramat-Gan) The Battle of La Forbie (1244) and its Aftermath – Re-examination of the Military Orders’ Involvement in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem in the mid-Thirteenth Century | 53 |
| <i>Jürgen Sarnowsky</i> (Hamburg) Die Ritterorden und der Krieg von St. Sabas | 69 |
| <i>Pierre Bonneaud</i> (Uzès) Negotiation and warfare: The Hospitallers of Rhodes around and after the Fall of Constantinople (1426–1480) | 81 |
| <i>Helen J. Nicholson</i> (Cardiff) The Hospitallers’ and Templars’ involvement in warfare on the frontiers of the British Isles in the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries | 105 |

II. OTHER STUDIES

- László Pószán* (Debrecen)
Der Deutsche Orden im mittelalterlichen Ungarn 123
- Christian Vogel* (Saarbrücken)
Meisterwahlen in den mittelalterlichen Ritterorden – Johanniter, Templer
und Deutscher Orden im Vergleich 137

III. MISCELLANEOUS AND OTHER MATERIALS

- Paweł A. Jeziorski* (Toruń)
Das Verzeichnis der von Hochmeister Ludwig von Erlichshausen
Begnadigten. Eine Quelle zur Geschichte der hochmeisterlichen
Landrundreise in den Jahren 1450–1451 157

IV. BOOK REVIEWS AND BOOK NOTICES

- Documents Concerning Cyprus from the Hospital's Rhodian Archives: 1409–1459*,
ed. Karl Borchardt, Anthony Luttrell, Ekhard Schöffler (*Jürgen Sarnowsky*) 203
- Zsolt Hunyadi, *The Hospitallers in the Medieval Kingdom of Hungary c. 1150–
–1387* (*Gábor Bradács*) 204
- Bernhart Jähmig, Verfassung und Verwaltung des Deutschen Ordens und seiner
Herrschaft in Livland (*Piotr Oliński*) 206
- Máté Molnár, *A templomos lovagrend alkonya* (*Ádám Debreczeni*) 208
- Nicholas Edward Morton, *The Teutonic Knights in the Holy Land 1190–1291*
(*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 211
- Anat Peled, *Sugar in the Kingdom of Jerusalem. A Crusader Technology between
East and West* (*Shlomo Lotan*) 213
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Templer* (*Maria Starnawska*) 215
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Johanniter. Ein geistlicher Ritterorden in Mittelalter und
Neuzeit* (*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 217
- Magdalena Satora, *Sprawa templariuszy w dyplomacji zachodnioeuropejskiej 1307–
–1312* (*Piotr Oliński*) 221
- Tannenberg – Grunwald – Žalgiris 1410. Krieg und Frieden im späten Mittelalter*,
hrsg. v. Werner Paravicini, Rimvydas Petrauskas, Grischa Vercamer (*Krzysztof
Kwiatkowski*) 222



HELEN J. NICHOLSON (Cardiff)

THE HOSPITALLERS' AND TEMPLARS' INVOLVEMENT IN WARFARE ON THE FRONTIERS OF THE BRITISH ISLES IN THE LATE THIRTEENTH AND EARLY FOURTEENTH CENTURIES*

The military religious orders' vocation was to defend Christianity against non-Christians, not to fight other Christians. Alan Forey has shown that they played little role in papally-initiated holy wars against Christians in the thirteenth century.¹ However, there were various occasions during the thirteenth century and later in which the military religious orders became involved in warfare between Catholic Christians. Bernard Schotte has recently shown that in 1302–1303 the Templars and Hospitallers of Flanders were involved with the burghers of Flanders in warfare against the king of France, as the city of Bruges reimbursed the Templars' and Hospitallers' expenses in the Bruges communal army. He also demonstrated that the conflict between the French and Flemish was depicted by individuals on both sides as a holy war.² The army which King Edward I of England led against the kingdom of Scotland in 1298 included the master of the Temple in

* Abbreviations: CCR: *Calendar of the Close Rolls Preserved in the Public Record Office*, Prepared under the Superintendence of the Deputy Keeper of the Records, London 1892–1963; CDRI: *Calendar of Documents Relating to Ireland, Preserved in Her Majesty's Public Record Office, London*, ed. H. S. Sweetman, London 1875–1886; CPR: *Calendar of the Patent Rolls Preserved in the Public Record Office*, Prepared under the Superintendence of the Deputy Keeper of the Records, London 1891–1986; TNA: PRO: Kew, The National Archives: Public Record Office.

¹ A. Forey, *The Military Orders and Holy War against Christians in the Thirteenth Century*, *English Historical Review* 104 (1989), pp. 1–24; reprinted in: *Military Orders and Crusades*, ed. A. Forey, Aldershot 1994, article 8.

² B. Schotte, *Fighting the King of France: Templars and Hospitallers in the Flemish Rebellion of 1302*, in: *The Debate on the Trial of the Templars, 1307–1314*, ed. J. Burgtorf, P. F. Crawford, H. J. Nicholson, Aldershot 2010, pp. 49–53, 55.

England and the Hospitaller commander of North Wales.³ Adam Chapman has recently established that in 1294–1295 a Hospitaller commander was involved in military service under Edward I against the Welsh and again in 1298 against the Scots.⁴ The Hospitallers were involved in military action in Ireland from the 1270s until the Order's dissolution in the British Isles in the sixteenth century.⁵ Given that in the twelfth century Anglo-Norman writers regularly depicted the Scots, the Welsh and the Irish as barbarians who deserved no mercy,⁶ it could be suggested that the military orders believed that they were involved in some sort of holy war against these barbarous peoples. And when King Edward I of England claimed that, having been on crusade before becoming king, he was unable to set out on crusade again because of his wars in Wales and Ireland,⁷ it could be sug-

³ T. Parker, *The Knights Templars in England*, Tucson 1963, pp. 48, 150; *The Parliamentary Writs and Writs of Military Summons*, ed. F. Palgrave, London 1827–1830, vol. 1, pp. 303–304; William Rishanger, *Chronica et Annales regnantibus Henrico Tertio et Edwardo Primo, A.D. 1259–1307*, ed. H. T. Riley (Rolls Series 28.2), London 1865, p. 188; Thomas Walsingham, *Historia Anglicana*, ed. H. T. Riley (Rolls Series 28.1), London 1865, p. 76; *A Continuation of William of Newburgh's History to A.D. 1298*, in: *Chronicles of the Reigns of Stephen, Henry II and Richard I*, ed. R. Howlett (Rolls Series 82.2), London 1885, p. 583; *Flores Historiarum*, ed. H. R. Luard (Rolls Series 95), London 1890, vol. 3, p. 104.

⁴ I am very grateful to Adam Chapman for the following references: *The Book of Prests of the King's Wardrobe for 1294–5, presented to John Goronwy Edwards*, ed. E. B. Fryde, Oxford 1962, pp. xx, 58, 59, 61, 186, n. 3; H. Gough, *Scotland in 1298. Documents Relating to the Campaign of King Edward the First in that year, and especially to the Battle of Falkirk*, Paisley 1888, pp. 228–229. For Brother Ednevet or Odo de Nevet, commander of the Hospitaller commandery of Halston, see *Calendar of Chancery Warrants Preserved in the Public Record Office*, vol. 1: 1244–1326, Prepared under the Superintendence of the Deputy Keeper of the Records, ed. R. C. Fowler, London 1927, p. 45.

⁵ E. Massey, *Prior Roger Outlaw of Kilmainham, 1314–1341*, Dublin 2000, pp. 21, 24; H. Nicholson, *Serving King and Crusade: The Military Orders in Royal Service in Ireland, 1220–1400*, in: *The Experience of Crusading*, vol. 1: *Western Approaches*, ed. M. Bull, N. Housley, Cambridge 2003, pp. 240–241; G. O'Malley, *The Knights Hospitaller of the English Languge 1460–1565*, Oxford 2005, pp. 234–236, 239–241, 244, 250, 256–257.

⁶ See, for example, J. Gillingham, *Conquering the Barbarians: War and Chivalry in twelfth-century Britain and Ireland*, *The Haskins Society Journal* 4 (1992), pp. 67–84; idem, *The Beginnings of English Imperialism*, *Journal of Historical Sociology* 5 (1992), pp. 392–409; idem, *The English Invasion of Ireland*, in: *Representing Ireland: Literature and the Origins of Conflict, 1534–1660*, ed. B. Bradshaw, A. Hadfield, W. Maley, Cambridge 1993, pp. 24–42; idem, *Foundations of a Disunited Kingdom*, in: *Uniting the Kingdom? The Making of British History*, ed. A. Grant, K. J. Stringer, London 1995, p. 48–64; idem, *The travels of Roger Howden and his views of the Irish, Scots, and Welsh*, in: *Anglo-Norman Studies*, vol. XX, Woodbridge 1998, p. 151–169; all reprinted in: *The English in the Twelfth Century: Imperialism, National Identity and Political Values*, ed. J. Gillingham, Woodbridge 2000, pp. 3–18, 41–58, 69–91, 93–109, 145–160.

⁷ B. Weiler, *The Negotium Terrae Sanctae in the Political Discourse of Latin Christendom, 1215–1311*, *International History Review* 25 (2003), p. 21.

gested that the military orders assisted the king of England in his wars in these areas in order to – indirectly – assist his crusading cause.

In examining this problem, I will examine both published and unpublished records to establish which members of the military orders were involved in military action in Ireland, Scotland and Wales, how often and on what occasions this occurred, and their actual role. I will argue that in fact, the evidence indicates that the Templars' and Hospitallers' military involvement against the Welsh, the Scots and Irish was not holy war but resulted from their close working relationship with the local ruling class, to whom they were often closely related, and with the king of England. Although in theory they were independent religious orders answerable only to the pope, in the British Isles the Templars, and particularly the Hospitallers, were increasingly secularised institutions, serving the king of England and playing important roles in royal government: as has been recently argued for the Hospitallers by Simon Phillips.⁸

This discussion will begin by considering the Templars' and Hospitallers' military activity in the most peaceful of the frontier zones of the British Isles, Wales.

WALES

Although medieval Wales and its borderlands with England were areas of raiding and minor hostilities, and the kings of England before Edward I led regular expeditions into Wales to curb the power of particularly effective Welsh leaders, the military religious orders were not involved in hostilities except during the reign of Edward I (1272–1307). Edward I's wars against the Welsh were a dispute over lordship: whether the prince of Gwynedd (north Wales) or the king of England would dominate Wales.⁹

However, there were aspects of the wars which could have been exploited as a holy war. The archbishop of Canterbury, John Peckham, stated that some Welsh laws were against the Old and New Testament,¹⁰ while the Welsh declared that they were fighting a just war and they would not surrender to the English because the king's officials were crueller than Saracens.¹¹ In answer, Peckham retorted that

⁸ S. Phillips, *The Prior of the Knights Hospitaller in late Medieval England*, Woodbridge 2009.

⁹ M. Prestwich, *Edward I*, London 1988, p. 177.

¹⁰ *Multa alia [...] quae utriusque Testamenti legibus derogant manifesti*, in: *Registrum epistolarum Johannis Peckham*, ed. C. T. Martin (Rolls Series 77), London 1882–1884, vol. 1, p. 136; discussion in Prestwich, *Edward I* (as n. 9), p. 186.

¹¹ *Registrum epistolarum* (as n. 10), vol. 2, pp. 467, 469–471, 471–473; discussion in Prestwich, *Edward I* (as n. 9), pp. 191, 200; K. Hurlock, *Power, Preaching and the Crusades in Pura Wallia*

Welsh tradition was based on pagan kings and Welsh law was established by a king who had four wives, *contra Evangelium*.¹² This might suggest that Pecham could have regarded a war against the Welsh as holy, intended to enforce good Christian law. Yet neither side actually claimed that the war was holy, let alone a crusade, and an attempt by King Edward in January 1283 to borrow crusade taxes to meet the expenses of his Welsh wars met with such opposition – including objections from Archbishop Pecham, who called the affair a *grave scandalum* – that he had to repay the money.¹³

So the surviving records do not indicate that the secular and religious leaders of the realm saw these wars as holy or crusades. Nevertheless, the Templars and Hospitallers were involved in them. On 24 May 1282, Brother Richard Peitevin, then lieutenant-commander of the Temple in England, was granted by King Edward I ‘protection with clause *nolumus*, with reference to the king’s army in Wales’, which suggests that he was involved in military action for the king in the war against Llywelyn ap Gruffydd, prince of Gwynedd.¹⁴ In 1288, during the rebellion of Rhys ap Meredec, the king wrote to Edmund Mortimer and the other constables of royal castles in Wales, to inform them that Brother William of Henley, prior of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem in England, was coming to Wales to survey the state of the castles and the king’s munitions there and see how things were. The constables were to give him every assistance and give credence to whatever Brother William told them on the king’s behalf. Although the prior was not involved in hostilities, in surveying and reporting on the defences of the royal castles at this time of crisis he was actively assisting the king’s war effort.¹⁵

On 11 December 1294, Brother Odo, commander of the house of Halston and Ellesmere (which included the Hospitallers’ property in North Wales), *qui de*

c. 1180–1280, in: *Thirteenth Century England XI: The Proceedings of the Gregynog Conference*, ed. B. Weiler, J. Burton, P. Schofield, K. Stöber, Woodbridge 2007, pp. 102–103.

¹² *Registrum epistolarum* (as n. 10), vol. 2, pp. 473–474: 14 November 1282.

¹³ Prestwich, *Edward I* (as n. 9), pp. 238–239, citing W. E. Lunt, *Financial Relations of the Papacy with England to 1327*, Cambridge 1939, pp. 336–337; J. E. Morris, *The Welsh Wars of Edward I: A Contribution to Mediaeval Military History, Based on Original Documents*, Oxford 1901, p. 186; *Registrum epistolarum* (as n. 10), vol. 2, pp. 548–549 (13 May 1283), 635–638 (29 November 1283); Hurlock, *Power* (as n. 11), pp. 104, 106–108. For wider discussion of this point see K. Hurlock, *Wales and the Crusades, c. 1095–1291*, Cardiff 2011, pp. 193–199, 204.

¹⁴ CPR, *Edward I, AD 1281–1292*, p. 24; apparently acting as lieutenant for grand commander Robert of Turville, who had gone to Scotland on 16 May (p. 20). However, he is not mentioned by Morris, *The Welsh Wars* (as n. 13), pp. 154–185.

¹⁵ *Calendar of the Welsh Rolls*, in: *Calendar of Various Chancery Rolls: supplementary Close Rolls, Welsh Rolls, Scutage Rolls preserved in the Public Record Office*, Prepared under the Superintendence of the Deputy Keeper of the Records, 1277–1326, London 1912, pp. 319–320; TNA: PRO C 77/7, membrane 8 dorse (Welsh Rolls, 14–23 Edward I).

precepto Regis moratur cum Rege in partibus Wallie, received royal letters of protection for himself and his personal household. He was only one of the many warriors and clergy who were given such letters while they were with the king in Wales.¹⁶ In December 1294 and January 1295 Brother Odo de Nevet and Madog ap Dafydd of Hendwr were reimbursed a total of £500 from the King's Wardrobe for paying a force of Welsh infantry stationed at Penllyn in Meirionnedd (Merioneth). It appears that the Hospitaller commander had been involved in putting down the rebellion of Madog ap Llywelyn that winter (September 1294 – March 1295).¹⁷

I have not yet found any further references to Odo's military activity in Wales, but he also played an active role in Edward I's wars in Scotland, alongside his neighbours from North Wales.

SCOTLAND

In the medieval period, Scotland was an independent kingdom. The Templars and Hospitallers were established there from at least the mid twelfth century. After the deaths of King Alexander III of Scotland in 1286 and of his infant grand-daughter Margaret in 1290, the throne of Scotland was disputed between rival heirs and King Edward I of England was invited to act as arbiter. In 1291 Edward took oaths of fealty from the nobles and heads of religious houses in Scotland, including Alexander de Welles, prior of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem in Scotland, and Brian le Jay, commander of the knighthood of the Temple.¹⁸ In 1296 the nobles of Scotland again did fealty to the king of England, with Brother Alexander acting for the Hospital, while Brother John de Sautre, acting on behalf of Brian le Jay, did so for the Templars.¹⁹

¹⁶ TNA: PRO C 67/10 (letters of protection for those going to Wales, 1294–5), at mem. 4.

¹⁷ *The Book of Prests of the King's Wardrobe for 1294–5, presented to John Goronwy Edwards*, ed. E. B. Fryde, Oxford 1962, p. xxx, 58, 59, 61, 186, n. 3. I am very grateful to Adam Chapman for these references. For Odo as commander of Halston, see *Calendar of Chancery Warrants, 1244–1326* (as n. 4), p. 45. For the uprising of 1294–1295 see Morris, *The Welsh Wars* (as n. 13), pp. 240–266; R. F. Walker, *Madog ap Llywelyn (fl. 1277–1295)*, in: *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. H. C. G. Matthew, B. Harrison, Oxford 2004, vol. 36, p. 94.

¹⁸ *Calendar of Documents Relating to Scotland*, ed. J. Bain, vol. 2: AD 1272–1307, Edinburgh 1884, p. 125.

¹⁹ *Calendar of Documents Relating to Scotland* (as n. 18), pp. 202, 220; TNA: PRO C71/2, mem. 11: the king informs the sheriff of Edinburgh that he has taken the prior of St Andrew into his peace and confirms his lands (2 September 1296), and he does the same for a long list of others, including the master of the knighthood of the Temple in Scotland (followed by a list of his

In 1297 widespread rebellions broke out in Scotland, led by William Wallace and Andrew Murray, who on 11 September 1297 won a significant victory over the English at Stirling Bridge. On 20 November King Edward sent out summonses to all heads of religious houses in England, including the prior of the Hospital and the master of the Temple in England, to assemble troops at Newcastle upon Tyne on 6 December. The major campaign which followed did not begin until June 1298, and I have not found any mention of the prior of the Hospital taking part in person.²⁰ However, Brother Brian le Jay, master of the Temple in England, was given letters of protection for the June campaign, for himself and two followers, Peter de Suthchirche and Thomas de Caune, who were not called *frater* and so were not Templars.²¹ The king gave Brother Brian permission to appoint representatives to act on his behalf during his absence.²²

Also on the expedition was Brother Edenevet, *Magister Hospitalis*. Brother Edenevet and his horse were recorded in a group of twenty five mounted men from North Wales, led by John de Havering, justiciar of North Wales, and including four noble knights: John de Ligerio, Gwilym (William) de la Pole, Robert of London and Walter de Bessy. There were also twenty *valetti* (literally 'lads', but generally translated 'squires') including Gwilym's brother Gruffydd, Llywelyn ap Gruffydd, Einion ap Ieuan and Meurig Atteben.²³

These men included members of the leading noble families of Wales. Gwilym and Gruffydd de la Pole were the sons of Gruffydd ap Gwenwynwyn, prince of Upper Powys and one of the great barons of Wales. Gruffydd ap Gwenwynwyn had been a supporter of King Henry III of England, and supported King Edward I throughout the king's wars against the prince of Gwynedd. After Edward's conquest of Wales, Gruffydd became an English marcher baron and his children adopted the surname de la Pole. They were loyal supporters of the English king in Wales.²⁴

holdings) and the master of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem in Scotland (followed by a list of his holdings).

²⁰ Parker, *The Knights Templars* (as n. 3), pp. 48, 150, citing *Parliamentary Writs* (as n. 3), vol. 1, pp. 303–304, 747, 821, 868; Prestwich, *Edward I* (as n. 9), pp. 476–479. Simon Phillips notes that the Hospitaller commanders of Mayne and Buckland were also summoned, and that the prior and these two commanders were summoned again in 1300: Phillips, *The Prior* (as n. 8), p. 46, citing *Parliamentary Writs* (as n. 3), vol. 1, pp. 304, 386, 289, 293, 333, 336–337.

²¹ *Scotland in 1298. Documents relating to the Campaign of King Edward I in that year, and especially to the Battle of Falkirk*, ed. H. Gough, Paisley 1888, p. 48; Morris, *The Welsh Wars* (as n. 13), p. 91.

²² *Scotland in 1298* (as n. 21), p. 53.

²³ *Scotland in 1298* (as n. 21), pp. 228–229. I am indebted to Adam Chapman for this reference.

²⁴ T. F. Tout, *Gruffudd ap Gwenwynwyn (d. 1286)*, revised by A. D. Carr, in: *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (as n. 17), vol. 24, p. 135–136; A. Chapman, *Welshmen in the Armies of*

This campaign resulted in the Battle of Falkirk, in which King Edward I's forces were victorious, but Brian le Jay was killed.²⁵ In contrast, Brother Ednevet survived the battle, as he appears again in Scotland in 1303.

In the rolls of wages paid to soldiers in Wales and Scotland, 32 Edward I (1303–4), Brother Ednevet, *magistro domus hospital' North Wall'* (master of the house of the Hospital of North Wales), appears three times. His name appears in a list of 21 men from North Wales, many of them with Welsh names, including Llywelyn ap Gruffydd, Gruffydd Vaughan, Meuricio de Bent (Meurig Atteben), Llywelyn Welt', Blethin Routh and Blethyn Call'is. In this record Brother Ednevet is leading infantry from North Wales; he was paid twelve *solidi* for his expenses and the expenses of one squire for four days, at three *solidi* a day. Brother Ednevet also appears in the margin of two other payments in lists of payments to men from North Wales. On both occasions his name appears next to a payment to *Leulinus Gragh* (Llywelyn Gragh), which is given *per m[andatum] fratris de Nevet* and *per m' fratris Edenevet*.²⁶ However, in a fourth list of the same names from North Wales, giving payments at Carlisle to cover the period from 28 June to 1 September, his name does not appear,²⁷ and I have not found his name in the later Scottish campaigns of Edward I or those of his son Edward II up to 1314. It is possible, of course, that he died on the campaign of 1303–1304.

The prior of the Hospital in England was summoned to Newcastle or York with his troops for service in Scotland again in 1316, 1317, 1318 and 1322, and in 1322 he was expected to appear in person, but it is not clear that he actually fought in any of the campaigns.²⁸ Again, he was expected to supply troops for the Scottish campaign in 1337, but did not join the campaign himself.²⁹ The physical involvement of members of the military religious orders in wars in Scotland seems to have been limited to the wars of Edward I, and the main participant was the Hospitaller Brother Ednevet.

Adam Chapman has observed that Brother Ednevet, master of the Hospital in North Wales, is almost certainly the same as Odo de Nevet, commander of Hal-

Edward I, in: *The Impact of the Edwardian Castles in Wales: Proceedings of a conference held in Bangor 7–9 September 2007*, ed. D. Williams, J. Kenyon, Oxford 2009, p. 177.

²⁵ William Rishanger, *Chronica* (as n. 3), p. 188; Thomas Walsingham, *Historia Anglicana* (as n. 3), p. 76; *Continuation of William of Newburgh's History* (as n. 3), p. 583; *Flores Historiarum* (as n. 3), p. 104.

²⁶ TNA: PRO E 101/12/17, mems 2, 4, 7.

²⁷ TNA: PRO E 101/12/17, mem. 9.

²⁸ Phillips, *The Prior* (as n. 8), pp. 46–47, citing *Parliamentary Writs* (as n. 3), vol. 1, pp. 463, 468, 488, 491, 495, 502, 505, 588; CCR, *Edward I: AD 1313–1318*, pp. 292, 473, 484, 562, 622–623.

²⁹ Phillips, *The Prior* (as n. 8), p. 47.

ston. ‘Edenevet’ is so similar to Ednyfed that it is practically certain that Brother Odo was actually Odo ap Ednyfed and was descended from Ednyfed Fychan, illustrious *distain* or steward of Prince Llywelyn ap Iorwerth of Gywnedd (1173–1240), who died in 1246. To quote the Welsh historian Glyn Roberts, Ednyfed’s ‘descendants formed a “ministerial aristocracy” of considerable wealth.’³⁰ Ednyfed himself was apparently a would-be crusader, although it is not clear whether he ever reached the Holy Land.³¹ His grandsons Rhys ap Gruffydd ap Ednyfed and Hywel ap Gruffydd supported Edward I after 1277, notably during in the Welsh war of 1282–4, in which Hywel died fighting for Edward.³² Rhys’s son Gruffydd Llywd (d. 1335) was ‘From 1297 to 1314 [...] in effect the king’s continual commissioner of array in North Wales: he repeatedly raised contingents of Welshmen for service in Flanders or Scotland, and himself served in both those theatres of war’;³³ and was a leading ‘member of that Welsh official class [...] which showed such remarkable loyalty to Edward II throughout his reign.’³⁴ In short, Brother Odo Ednyfed, commander of the Hospitaller commandery of North Wales, belonged to a Welsh noble family whose members were loyal servants and supporters of the king of England. Through his family, Odo also had connections with other Welsh noble families who were loyal to the English king: to judge by the composition of the party which he accompanied to Scotland in 1298, these included the princely family of Upper Powys. His involvement in hostilities in Wales and in Scotland would have been prompted by his own family’s loyalties and connections as much as by his Order’s vocation.

That said, it is worth considering whether Odo could have justified his military involvement in Scotland in terms of holy war. Certainly the crusade was mentioned during the Anglo-Scottish war, as King Edward I accused the Scots of prevent-

³⁰ G. Roberts, *Ednyfed Fychan (Ednyfed ap Cynwrig)*, in: *Welsh Biography Online* (National Library of Wales), at: <http://yba.llgc.org.uk/en/s-EDNY-FYC-1246.html>; G. Roberts, ‘*Wyrion Eden*: the Anglesey Descendants of Ednyfed Fychan in the Fourteenth Century’, in: *Aspects of Welsh History: Selected Papers of the Late Glyn Roberts*, Cardiff 1969, pp. 181–184; A. D. Carr, *Tudor Family, Forebears of (per. c. 1215–1404)*, in: *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (as n. 17), vol. 55, pp. 508–9.

³¹ Hurlock, *Wales* (as n. 13), pp. 121, 218.

³² Roberts, ‘*Wyrion Eden*’ (as n. 30), p. 185; Carr, *Tudor family* (as n. 30), p. 509.

³³ J. G. Edwards, *Gruffydd Llwyd, Sir, more fully Gruffydd ap Rhys ap Gruffydd ab Ednyfed*, in: *Welsh Biography Online* (as n. 30), at: <http://yba.llgc.org.uk/en/s-GRUF-LLW-1335.html>; J. G. Edwards, *Sir Gruffydd Llwyd*, *English Historical Review* 30 (1915), pp. 589–601; see also Carr, *Tudor family* (as n. 32).

³⁴ G. Roberts, *Hywel ap Gruffydd ap Iorwerth, or Syr Hywel y Pedolau*, in: *Welsh Biography Online* (as n. 30), at: <http://yba.llgc.org.uk/en/s-HYWE-APG-1250.html>; see also Chapman, *Welshmen* (as n. 24), p. 178; J. Beverley Smith, *Gruffydd Llwyd and the Celtic Alliance, 1315–18*, *Bulletin of the Board of Celtic Studies* 26 (1976), pp. 463–466.

ing his crusade plans.³⁵ However, as in Wales, the strongest crusading language was used by King Edward's opponents, against him. The author of the *Chronicle of Lanercost* (in Cumbria, north-west England) recorded that in 1295/1296 Scottish clergy tried to arouse the hostility of the nobility and people against the king and the English by claiming that it would be more justified to attack them than the Saracens.³⁶ In 1306/1307 King Edward I complained to Pope Clement V about the Scottish bishops who had joined Robert Bruce's revolt against him. He claimed that the bishop of Moray had said that those who helped Bruce would win the same merit as if they fought pagans and Saracens,³⁷ while the bishop of Glasgow told the Scots that fighting Edward was the equivalent of going on crusade to the Holy Land.³⁸ In 1309 and again in 1320 the ecclesiastical and secular leaders of Scotland stated that they would go on crusade when they had defeated the English,³⁹ and similar claims were made for King Robert I of Scotland:⁴⁰ thus accusing the English king of obstructing the crusade.

In short, both sides in the Anglo-Scots war compared their cause to a crusade, but even if Brian le Jay or Odo Ednyfed had tried to justify their military activity against the Scots by claiming that they were fighting for a crusading king (Edward I), the Scots had set out a strong counter-claim.

In short, there is no evidence that the members of the military orders who fought for King Edward I in Scotland did so for any reason other than they were performing military service as loyal subjects of their king, and – specifically in Odo

³⁵ Weiler, *The Negotium Terrae Sanctae* (as n. 7), p. 21.

³⁶ [...] *asserentes erronee abundantioris esse justitiae ipsos quam Sarracenos impetere* [...], see: *Chronicon de Lanercost MCCI–MCCCXLVI e codice Cottoniano nunc primum typis mandatum*, ed. J. Stevenson, Edinburgh 1838, pp. 165–166; A. Macquarrie, *Scotland and the Crusades, 1095–1560*, Edinburgh 1997, p. 71; Hurlock, *Power* (as n. 11), p. 106; Hurlock, *Wales* (as n. 13), p. 205.

³⁷ [...] *quod non minus possent mereri qui cum Domino Roberto [rege] in ipsius auxilium contra Regem Angliae et suos insurgerent et partem ipsius Roberti juvarent quam si in Terram Sanctam contra Paganos et Sarracenos proficissent*, see: *Documents and Records illustrating the history of Scotland*, ed. F. Palgrave, London 1837, p. 330; see also Macquarrie, *Scotland* (as n. 36), p. 71; Weiler, *The Negotium Terrae Sanctae* (as n. 7), p. 21.

³⁸ *Qu'il porront a tant faire meryr de estre de la cord le dit Counte [de Carrick, that is, Robert Bruce] et de meintenir la guerre contre le Roy d'Engleterre qui est leur Seigneur lige come d'aler en le service Dieu en la Terre Sainte*, see: *Documents and Records* (as n. 37), p. 348; see also Macquarrie, *Scotland* (as n. 36), p. 71.

³⁹ Macquarrie, *Scotland* (as n. 36), pp. 22, 72, citing *Acts of the Parliament of Scotland*, ed. T. Thomson, C. Innes, Edinburgh 1814–1875, vol. 1, p. 459; Hurlock, *Power* (as n. 11), pp. 106–107; Hurlock, *Wales* (as n. 13), p. 205.

⁴⁰ *Chronique de Jean le Bel*, ed. J. Viard, E. Déprez, Paris 1904, vol. 1, pp. 83–84; Macquarrie, *Scotland* (as n. 36), pp. 73–75; Weiler, *The Negotium Terrae Sanctae* (as n. 7), pp. 22–23.

Ednyfed's case – they were performing military service alongside other members of their family and their princely neighbours and allies. This is even more marked when we consider the Hospitallers' military service in Ireland.

IRELAND

From the mid-thirteenth century onwards the Hospitallers were extensively involved in the service of the English king in Ireland.⁴¹ Perhaps no Hospitaller became more prominent in the English king's service in Ireland than Brother Stephen de Fulbourn (d. 1288), who became the king's treasurer in Ireland in 1274, rose to be justiciar in 1281, and ran the country in the interests of himself and his family.⁴² As leading members of the English king's administration in Ireland, from the 1270s onwards the priors of the Hospital in Ireland took part in active military service against the Irish, but were also at various times involved in fighting between the Anglo-Irish and rebellions against the king.⁴³ In July 1285 Prior William fitz Roger of the Hospital in Ireland was about to lead the king's army against the king's enemies in Connacht.⁴⁴ As justiciar of Ireland, Brother Stephen de Fulbourn led the king's army against the king's enemies in Ireland.⁴⁵ In 1302 payment of £100 was made in wages to men-at-arms in the company of Brother William de Ros, prior of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem in Ireland – who had been acting in place of John Wogan, justiciar of Ireland, who was in Scotland with the king – for the preservation of the king's peace in Leinster. In 1304 the king pardoned a felon because in 1302 he had been with Brother William de Ros fighting against the Irish in the mountains of Glanelory.⁴⁶ In August 1318 Brother Roger Outlaw or Utlagh, prior of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem in Ireland, was rewarded for his good service against the Scots who had invaded Ireland with Edward Bruce, and in compensation for the losses inflicted on him.⁴⁷ In July 1338 Outlaw, now ex-chancellor of Ireland, was petitioning the king for payment of his wages from the time he was acting as lieutenant-justiciar and was chancellor of Ireland, and

⁴¹ For what follows, see Nicholson, *Serving King and Crusade* (as n. 5), pp. 240–241.

⁴² P. Connolly, *Fulbourn, Stephen of (d. 1288)*, in: *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (as n. 17), vol. 21, pp. 125–126.

⁴³ O'Malley, *The Knights Hospitaller* (as n. 5), pp. 234–236, 239–241, 244, 250, 256–257.

⁴⁴ CDRI, vol. 3, p. 369, no. 814 (including a force of Welsh).

⁴⁵ CDRI, vol. 2, p. 540; vol. 3, p. 251.

⁴⁶ CDRI, vol. 5, p. 5; CPR, *Edward I, AD 1301–1307*, p. 291; H. Nicholson, *The Knights Hospitaller on the Frontiers of the British Isles*, in: *Mendicants, Military Orders and Regionalism in Medieval Europe*, ed. J. Sarnowsky, Aldershot 1999, pp. 53–54.

⁴⁷ CPR, *Edward II, AD 1313–1317*, p. 197.

for the fees and wages of his men from the time he was in the king's service; the request for payment of his men indicates that he had been performing military service.⁴⁸ The Hospital in Ireland also possessed several fortified commanderies and was entrusted with royal fortresses to defend.⁴⁹

In June 1360 King Edward III noted that the Hospitallers in Ireland had complained to him about the loss of many of their lands and income. He noted that they maintained war against the enemies of the Christian faith on Rhodes, while in Ireland they *bonum locum ibidem nobis tenent ad repulsionem hibernicorum hostium nostrorum guerram super fidelem populum nostrum in dies machmantum* (hold a good position there for the repulse of our Irish enemies, who daily maintain war upon our liege people).⁵⁰ The Hospitallers were claiming the king's special favour on the basis that they played a leading military role in Ireland, in addition to their holy war on Rhodes.

Yet all those who were involved in the royal administration in Ireland had by necessity to lead armies against rebels. The archbishop of Dublin and other churchmen who played leading roles in the English royal administration in Ireland fought in the field as part of their duties of office.⁵¹ In 1364 on the appointment of a new chancellor of Ireland, a layman, it was recorded that the chancellor must often ride to war and therefore could retain in his service six men-at-arms and twelve mounted archers at the rate of pay usually given to royal troops in Ireland.⁵² As Hospitaller prior of Ireland, Roger Outlaw maintained close relations with many of the senior officials in the England administration in Ireland, many of whom became corrody-holders at the Hospital's leading house at Kilmainham, near Dublin. He used these connections to protect and advance his Order's interests in the political and military turmoil of Ireland.⁵³ As a central figure in Anglo-Irish society, he could hardly have avoided involvement in war, which was a part of everyday life.

The Hospitallers, therefore, were engaged in military activities in Ireland because of their involvement in royal administration and political life, not simply because they were a military religious order. Nevertheless, to some degree holy warfare was part of military activity in Ireland, as both Irish and Anglo-Irish claimed

⁴⁸ CCR, *Edward III, AD 1337–1339*, p. 437.

⁴⁹ O'Malley, *The Knights Hospitaller* (as n. 5), p. 234.

⁵⁰ TNA: PRO, C54/198, mem. 27 (Close Rolls, 34 Edward III); CCR, *Edward III, AD 1360–1364*, p. 39.

⁵¹ J. Lydon, *The years of crisis, 1254–1315*, in: *A New History of Ireland*, vol. II: *Medieval Ireland, 1169–1534*, ed. A. Cosgrove, Oxford 1993, pp. 183–184; J. A. Watt, *The Anglo-Irish colony under strain, 1327–99*, in: *ibid.*, pp. 362–363.

⁵² CPR, *Edward III, AD 1364–1367*, p. 25.

⁵³ Massey, *Prior Roger* (as n. 5), pp. 24–42.

to be fighting a just war against the other. In Ireland there was a much clearer expression of crusading language than in Wales or Scotland. In the late 1320s or early 1330s, the justiciar (head of the English king's government in Ireland) and council of Ireland wrote to Pope John XXII asking him to authorise a crusade against the Irish. The grounds for this request were widespread heresy among the Irish, who (the letter stated) claimed that Mary the Lord's Mother was a whore, denied the resurrection of the dead, denied the king of England's right to rule Ireland and criticised papal policy. The heretics' leader, the letter claimed, was one Aduk Duff Octohyl. This is clearly a reference to the Irishman Adam Dubh Ó Tuathail, who was burned at the stake outside Dublin in 1328 for heretical beliefs.⁵⁴ Maeve Callan has pointed out that the other claims in the letter were an inversion of the 'Irish Remonstrance' of 1317 to Pope John XXII, in which the Irish had attacked the English record in Ireland, stating that the English have tyrannised the Irish, murdering them and destroying their property, forbidding them to join religious houses, preaching "the heresy that it is no more a sin to kill an Irish person than to kill a dog or any other brute beast" and that "they can commit armed robbery against the Irish with impunity", and that anyone who protested against this was declared an enemy of the king. The Remonstrance argued that the Irish were fighting a just war against the king of England and the Anglo-Irish.⁵⁵ Callan argued that the justiciar's letter, written over ten years later, deliberately conflated the charges against Adam Dubh with a reversed version of the claims in the Irish Remonstrance in the hope that the pope would help the Anglo-Irish/English against the Irish.⁵⁶ Perhaps the pope's memory was long enough to recognise this; in any case, he did not approve a crusade against the Irish, although in 1332 he did excommunicate the Irish of Leinster and put their lands under interdict.⁵⁷ In any case, the Hospitallers could claim that in fighting the Irish they were fighting a holy war.

⁵⁴ A. R. Neary, *Ó Tuathail, Adam Dubh (d. 1328)*, in: *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (as n. 17), vol. 42, pp. 114–115; Jacobi Grace Kilkenniensis, *Annales Hiberniae*, ed. and trans. R. Butler, Dublin 1842, pp. 106–107; *Il Registro di Andrea Sapiti, procuratore alla curia avignone*, ed. B. Bombi, Rome 2007, pp. 104–105; M. B. Callan, "No such art in this land": *Heresy and Witchcraft in Ireland, 1310–1360* (unpublished Ph.D. thesis, Northwestern University, Evanston IL (2002)), pp. 274–280.

⁵⁵ Callan, "No such art in this land" (as n. 54), pp. 280–288; for an English translation of the Remonstrance see: *Robert the Bruce's Irish Wars: The Invasion of Ireland, 1306–1329*, ed. S. Duffy, Stroud 2002, pp. 179–186, here 183–184.

⁵⁶ Callan, "No such art in this land" (as n. 54), p. 280.

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*

LATER DEVELOPMENTS

The Hospitallers continued to play a military role in the British Isles throughout the late medieval period. Prior Philip de Thame was summoned to supply troops for the 1337 campaign in Scotland. However, as Simon Phillips has shown, from 1339 (the beginning of the Hundred Years War) the military role of the prior of the Hospital in England changed from providing feudal service to official appointments, such as acting as keeper of Southampton in 1339, or acting as Admiral of the Fleet. In some cases, where the prior had previous naval experience in the eastern Mediterranean, he performed active service at sea. Other Hospitallers could also be involved in the discharge of the prior's duties. These activities were generally defensive, except in 1513 when Prior Docwra and four other English Hospitallers were involved in active military service in the invasion of France, prompting complaints from the king of Scotland's secretary that his participation was unchristian. Such military involvement led to the Prior gaining political influence, so that by the early fifteenth century he ranked between the lay earls and barons in Parliament. Despite this lay status, the Hospital remained a religious institution and King Henry VIII dissolved it in 1540 as part of his dissolution of the monasteries. Yet even after the Order's dissolution, several of its former members continued to serve the king as naval officers.⁵⁸

In contrast, in Ireland the language of crusade continued to be used as part of the ongoing hostilities between the rival peoples. During the reign of King Henry V, an Anglo-Irish parliament proposed that the king should ask the pope to authorise a crusade against the native Irish.⁵⁹ Even after the dissolution of the Hospitallers in 1540, leading members of the Anglo-Irish establishment suggested re-forming the Order in Ireland to fight the Irish.⁶⁰

CONCLUSION

Björn Weiler has pointed out that in the twelfth and early thirteenth centuries "the idea of the crusade permeated all levels of political society in Latin Christendom, and became a standard by which to evaluate the morality of political actions".⁶¹

⁵⁸ Phillips, *The Prior* (as n. 8), pp. 45–58, especially pp. 52, 55–56, 100–102; O'Malley, *The Knights Hospitaller* (as n. 5), pp. 327–329.

⁵⁹ E. Matthew, *Henry V and the Proposal for an Irish Crusade*, in: *Ireland and the English World in the Late Middle Ages*, ed. B. Smith, Basingstoke 2009, pp. 161–75.

⁶⁰ O'Malley, *The Knights Hospitaller* (as n. 5), p. 256.

⁶¹ Weiler, *The Negotium Terrae Sanctae* (as n. 7), p. 36.

However, although the war between the French and the Flemish in the early fourteenth century was depicted by both sides as a holy war, there is no evidence that the military orders were involved for religious reasons; it appears that their involvement was part of their duty as citizens of the towns of Flanders, and they were reimbursed for their expenses. Furthermore, although the military orders fought in the wars of King Edward I of England, their involvement was not motivated by holy war, as the king did not cite crusading ideology to justify his wars in which members of the military religious orders fought. As Edward regularly employed Hospitallers in particular for important tasks – such as Joseph de Chauncy, treasurer of the Hospital, as treasurer of England, and Stephen de Fulbourn as treasurer and then justiciar of Ireland – it was only to be expected that he should trust the Hospitallers with important matters of security such as the state of his defences in Wales. The Hospitaller commander who took part in Edward's campaigns in Wales and Scotland was a member of a noble North Welsh family who consistently gave military support to Edward, and fought alongside members of other noble Welsh families who did the same. Perhaps the Hospitallers also hoped to benefit financially from their support of Edward I in Wales, as he confirmed generous rights to them after his conquest of 1284⁶² – although whether they were able to enforce the rights the king granted them is another matter. In Ireland the Hospitaller commander was part of a social-political network of Anglo-Irish landowners who ruled much of Ireland and fought the Irish to maintain that position. Overall, the motivation for the military orders' involvement in these wars was not holy war against Christians. Instead, members of leading families, who happened to be members of the military orders, performed military service to the English king and took part in the English king's wars.

⁶² *Calendar of Welsh Rolls* (as n. 15), p. 287; TNA: PRO C77/7, mem. 5 (Welsh Rolls, 12 Edward I).

