

ORDINES MILITARES
COLLOQUIA TORUNENSIA HISTORICA
Yearbook for the Study of the Military Orders

vol. XVII (2012)



Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

EDITORIAL BOARD

Roman Czaja, Editor in Chief, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń
Jürgen Sarnowsky, Editor in Chief, University of Hamburg

Jochen Burgtorf, California State University
Sylvain Gouguenheim, École Normale Supérieure Lettres et Sciences Humaines de Lyon
Hubert Houben, Università del Salento Lecce
Alan V. Murray, University of Leeds
Krzysztof Kwiatkowski, Assistant Editor, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń

REVIEWERS:

Darius von Guettner, School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, University of Melbourne
Sławomir Józwiak, Institute of History and Archival Sciences, Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń
Tomasz Jurek, Institute of History of Polish Academy of Sciences
Juhan Kreem, City Archives of Tallinn
Johannes A. Mol, Institute for History, University Leiden
Maria Starnawska, Institute of History, Jan Długosz University in Częstochowa
Sławomir Zonnenberg, Institute of History and International Relationships, Kazimierz Wielki University in Bydgoszcz

ADDRESS OF EDITORIAL OFFICE:

Instytut Historii i Archiwistyki UMK, ul. Gagarina 9
87-100 Toruń
e-mail: rc@umk.pl
juergen.sarnowsky@uni-hamburg.de

Subscriptions orders should be addressed to:
books@umk.pl

Printed in Poland

© Copyright by Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
© Copyright by Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

ISSN 0867-2008

NICOLAUS COPERNICUS UNIVERSITY PRESS

EDITORIAL OFFICE: ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

tel. (0) 56 611 42 95, fax (0) 56 611 47 05

e-mail: wydawnictwo@umk.pl

DISTRIBUTION: ul. Reja 25, 87-100 Toruń

tel./fax (0) 56 611 42 38

e-mail: books@umk.pl

www.wydawnictwoumk.pl

First edition

Print: Nicolaus Copernicus University Press
ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

CONTENTS

I. STUDIES AND ARTICLES FROM THE 16TH ORDINES MILITARES CONFERENCE

<i>Philippe Josserand</i> (Nantes) Grenze(n) und geistliche Ritterorden in der lateinischen Welt des Mittelalters	7
<i>Damien Carraz</i> (Clermont-Ferrand) <i>Sub eiusdem pacis et treugue Dei defensione</i> . Die Ritterorden und der Frieden in Südfrankreich im 12. Jahrhundert	17
<i>Alan Forey</i> (Kirtlington) The Participation of the Military Orders in Truces with Muslims in the Holy Land and Spain during the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries	41
<i>Shlomo Lotan</i> (Ramat-Gan) The Battle of La Forbie (1244) and its Aftermath – Re-examination of the Military Orders’ Involvement in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem in the mid-Thirteenth Century	53
<i>Jürgen Sarnowsky</i> (Hamburg) Die Ritterorden und der Krieg von St. Sabas	69
<i>Pierre Bonneaud</i> (Uzès) Negotiation and warfare: The Hospitallers of Rhodes around and after the Fall of Constantinople (1426–1480)	81
<i>Helen J. Nicholson</i> (Cardiff) The Hospitallers’ and Templars’ involvement in warfare on the frontiers of the British Isles in the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries	105

II. OTHER STUDIES

- László Pószán* (Debrecen)
Der Deutsche Orden im mittelalterlichen Ungarn 123
- Christian Vogel* (Saarbrücken)
Meisterwahlen in den mittelalterlichen Ritterorden – Johanniter, Templer
und Deutscher Orden im Vergleich 137

III. MISCELLANEOUS AND OTHER MATERIALS

- Paweł A. Jeziorski* (Toruń)
Das Verzeichnis der von Hochmeister Ludwig von Erlichshausen
Begnadigten. Eine Quelle zur Geschichte der hochmeisterlichen
Landrundreise in den Jahren 1450–1451 157

IV. BOOK REVIEWS AND BOOK NOTICES

- Documents Concerning Cyprus from the Hospital's Rhodian Archives: 1409–1459*,
ed. Karl Borchardt, Anthony Luttrell, Ekhard Schöffler (*Jürgen Sarnowsky*) 203
- Zsolt Hunyadi, *The Hospitallers in the Medieval Kingdom of Hungary c. 1150–
–1387* (*Gábor Bradács*) 204
- Bernhart Jähmig, Verfassung und Verwaltung des Deutschen Ordens und seiner
Herrschaft in Livland (*Piotr Oliński*) 206
- Máté Molnár, *A templomos lovagrend alkonya* (*Ádám Debreczeni*) 208
- Nicholas Edward Morton, *The Teutonic Knights in the Holy Land 1190–1291*
(*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 211
- Anat Peled, *Sugar in the Kingdom of Jerusalem. A Crusader Technology between
East and West* (*Shlomo Lotan*) 213
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Templer* (*Maria Starnawska*) 215
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Johanniter. Ein geistlicher Ritterorden in Mittelalter und
Neuzeit* (*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 217
- Magdalena Satora, *Sprawa templariuszy w dyplomacji zachodnioeuropejskiej 1307–
–1312* (*Piotr Oliński*) 221
- Tannenberg – Grunwald – Žalgiris 1410. Krieg und Frieden im späten Mittelalter*,
hrsg. v. Werner Paravicini, Rimvydas Petrauskas, Grischa Vercamer (*Krzysztof
Kwiatkowski*) 222

property of the Knights Templar in France. In fact, Philip IV agreed to do so in Poitiers in 1308 and closely followed the established procedures. The resources obtained from the Templar properties were to be spent on crusades, and the Pope opted for the idea of passing the wealth of the Knights Templar on to the Knights Hospitaller. The monarchs of Aragon and England originally objected to the dissolution of the order, and their foreign policy was aimed at protecting it. However, they changed their minds when they realized that they could seize the wealth of the order themselves.

Apart from the meeting of the French king and his representatives with the Pope and his advisors in Poitiers in 1308, another key event which led to final decisions being made was the Council of Vienne in 1311. The council was also attended by the representatives of King James II of Aragon and King Edward II of England, whose priority was to solve the English-French conflict concerning the duchy of Guyenne, which they finally succeeded in accomplishing.

The author emphasizes the considerable independence of Pope Clement V in taking decisions. She also stresses that the pressure from Philip IV was much less significant than has been previously stated in literature on the subject. The Pope insisted on the dissolution of the order against the majority of the clergy, which was especially noticeable at the Council of Vienne. Philip IV cooperated with the Pope quite peacefully, his main motivation being to gain resources to finance another crusade. The policy of Edward II of England was driven by his particularistic interests in strengthening his rule within the complicated situation in his kingdom, and in relations with Scotland. Edward II objected to the Pope regarding the wealth of the Knights Templar, as did King James II of Aragon.

Piotr Oliński (Toruń)

Tannenberg – Grunwald – Žalgiris 1410. Krieg und Frieden im späten Mittelalter, hrsg. v. Werner Paravicini, Rimvydas Petrauskas, Grischa Vercamer (Deutsches Historisches Institut Warschau. *Quellen und Studien*, Bd. 26), Harrasowitz-Verlag, Wiesbaden 2012, 356 pp., 1 map, ISBN 978-3-447-06661-7.

Among numerous publications appearing in Central Europe in connection with the 600th anniversary of the battle of Tannenberg/Grunwald/Žalgiris (15 July 1410) the volume discussed here undoubtedly finds itself in the ranks of the most highly esteemed texts. It includes articles from outstanding experts on the subject of the Polish-Lithuanian and Teutonic war of 1409–1411 and on the 15th cen-

ture conflicts between the Teutonic Order and the countries of the Jagiellonian union, which were presented at the scientific conference “Žalgiris – Griunvaldas – Tanenbergas 1410: Karas ir taika vėlyvaisiais vuduramžiais / Žalgiris – Grunwald – Grunwald 1410. Krieg und Frieden im späten Mittelalter”, organized in Vilnius on 21–23 October 2010 in cooperation with Vilnius University (Vilniaus universitetas), The Institute of the History of Lithuania (Lietuvos Istorijos Institutas), The German Historical Institute in Warsaw (Deutsches Historisches Institut, Warschau) and the University of Christian Albrecht in Kiel (Christian-Albrechts Universität zu Kiel).

The twenty-one articles included in the volume (not counting the preface by the editors (pp. 9–19) and the conclusion by Werner Paravicini) are divided into five thematic chapters, corresponding to the sessions at the Vilnius conference. This division reflects the complexity of both the battle of Grunwald and the conflicts between Poland-Lithuania and the Teutonic Order in the first half of the 15th century, particularly when – according to the norms of modern medieval studies – they are presented in a contemporary cultural context. In the first part (“Ostmitteleuropa an der Wende vom 14. zum 15. Jahrhundert”) Martin Kintzinger presents how, in the second half of the 20th century, the battle of Grunwald and Polish-Lithuanian and Teutonic relations at the beginning of the 15th century have been perceived, discussed and understood in Western European historical literature, particularly German and French. He also refers to actions taken by the Polish-Lithuanian party after 1410 with the aim of changing the image of Christians’ attitude to non-Christians at the time (“Perspektivenwechsel. Internationale Beziehungen zwischen West- und Osteuropa im Spätmittelalter”, pp. 13–26), whereas Thomas Wünsch, continuing the preliminary considerations of the previous article, presents new research on the subject of the beginnings of the idea of international law (“Paulus Wladimiri und die Genese des ‘realistischen Denkens’ in der Lehre von den internationalen Beziehungen: Der Krieg zwischen Polen und dem Deutschen Orden als Stimulus für ein neues politiktheoretisches Paradigma”, pp. 27–42). Stephen C. Rowell outlines the conditions under which the union between the kingdom of Poland and the Grand Duchy of Lithuania was concluded, stressing the point of view represented by the Lithuanians of the time (“The Grand Duchy of Lithuania and the Beginning of the Union with Poland: the Background of Grunwald”, pp. 43–51). Artūras Dubonis touches upon an important question of intercultural relations in the transitional zone between the State of the Teutonic Order and Lithuania, which was mainly but not exclusively characterized by conflicts (“Das Grenzgebiet zwischen Litauen und dem Deutschen Orden: soziale, wirtschaftliche, administrative, ethnische und kulturelle Kommunikation in den Jahren 1290–1422”, pp. 53–65).

The second part of the volume deals with how war was conducted in the late Middle Ages. However, it does not refer to the so-called ‘art of war’ („Kriegsführung im späten Mittelalter”), but to the actual practice of military campaigns. Although the German word ‘Kriegsführung’ includes first meaning, the subjects treated by the authors sometimes go beyond the limitations imposed by their editors. The section starts with a broad and valuable study by Philippe Contamine concerning the phenomenon of battles within the culture of Western Europe during the late Middle Ages (“Die Schlacht im Abendland am Ende des Mittelalters: Vorstellung, Kampfhandlung, Bericht, Bild und Erinnerung”, pp. 69–88). The next article, written by Hans-Henning Kortüm, relates to a similar theme, but differs methodologically. The author attempts to analyse the battle of Tannenberg/Grünwald/Žalgiris anthropologically from a historical and cultural perspective (“Die Tannenbergschlacht im Kontext der spätmittelalterlichen Kriegs- bzw. Schlachtgeschichte”, pp. 89–101). Malte Prietzel in the next study attempts to outline the most significant issues connected with the way military campaigns changed in the late Middle Ages (in the traditional meaning of the term ‘Kriegsführung’) on the basis of research of the last two or three decades, achieving a successful historical-military description of the military context of the battle of Grünwald (“Veränderungen in der spätmittelalterlichen Kriegsführung”, pp. 103–121).

The economic aspects of conducting a war in the 15th century are depicted by Jürgen Sarnowsky (“Wirtschaftliche Aspekte der Geschichte der Kriege am Beginn des 15. Jahrhunderts”, pp. 123–134), and by Uwe Tresp, who writes about the use of hired contingents in conflicts between Poland-Lithuania and the Teutonic Order at the beginning of the 15th century (“Söldner aus den Ländern der Böhmischen Krone in den Kriegen zwischen dem Deutschen Orden und Polen-Litauen zu Beginn des 15. Jahrhunderts”, pp. 135–158). Darius Baronas shows the changes in how military campaigns were carried out by the armies of the Lithuanian dukes for almost two hundred years, from the creation of a monarchy in Lithuania down to the Grünwald period (“Der Kontext der litauischen Kriegskunst des 13. Jahrhunderts und die militärischen Innovationen von der zweiten Hälfte des 14. Jahrhunderts bis zum Beginn des 15. Jahrhunderts”, pp. 159–173). The study of Grischa Vercamer, within the context of social history, reveals the considerable importance of ‘free’ Prussians living mainly in East Prussia for the organization of the army of the Teutonic Order there and for military cooperation during conflicts with Lithuania and Poland (“Die Freien im Deutschordensland Preußen als militärischer Rückhalt Ende des 14. – Anfang des 15. Jahrhunderts”, pp. 175–189). Another (partly social) aspect of military campaigns in the conflicts between the Teutonic Order and Poland-Lithuania at the beginning of the 15th century is presented by Sławomir Józwiak in his study concerning espionage campaigns carried

out by the Teutonic Order (“Spionage zur Zeit des polnisch-litauischen Krieges gegen den Deutschen Orden 1409–1411”, pp. 191–197).

The next part of the volume comprises five articles which focus on non-confrontational relations between Poland-Lithuania and the Teutonic Order („Formen friedlicher Beziehungen”). Klaus Neitmann discusses the diplomatic practice of concluding peace treaties from the Treaty of Salynas to the Treaty of Brest (“Vom ‘ewigen Frieden’. Die Kunst des Friedensschlusses zwischen dem Deutschen Orden und Polen-Litauen 1398–1435”, pp. 201–209). Jean-Marie Moeglin presents the practice of mediation in the wider European context of the late Middle Ages (“Krieg und Vermittlungsverfahren in Europa in den letzten Jahrhunderten des Mittelalters”, pp. 211–222), while Adam Szweda in his richly documented lecture discusses the organization of meetings and diplomatic conventions between the kingdom of Poland and the Teutonic Order, as well as communication via different types of envoys („Polen und der Deutsche Orden – Botenwesen und friedliche Verhandlungen”, pp. 223–236). In the fourth study of this part of the publication Rimvydas Petrauskas examines changes in Lithuanian and Teutonic relations, which at the turn of the 14th and 15th centuries evolved from permanent military conflict to political cooperation (“Litauen und der Deutsche Orden: Vom Feind zum Verbündeten”, pp. 237–251). Werner Paravicini examines a similar aspect of change, mainly regarding the culture of knights and court (“Litauer: vom heidnischen Gegner zum adligen Standesgenossen”, pp. 253–282).

The fourth part of the publication deals strictly with the battle of Grunwald („Die Schlacht von Tannenberg/Grunwald/Žalgiris”). Sven Ekdahl, the most highly-regarded contemporary expert on the subject presents all of his considerations and remarks hitherto made in relation to the question of the tactics employed during the battle by both parties (“Quellenaussagen über die Taktik in der Tannenbergsschlacht”, pp. 285–300). Klaus Militzer touches upon the complicated but very significant problem of communication, particularly symbolic, between the members of both armies (“Kommunikations- und Verständigungsprobleme vor und nach der Schlacht bei Tannenberg”, pp. 301–305).

The last part of the volume consists of two articles devoted to the reception of the battle of Grunwald in later periods („Erinnerungen an die Schlacht von Tannenberg/Grunwald/Žalgiris”). Henadž Sahanovič, against the editors’ intention that the last part of the publication should deal with the question of the perception of the battle, discusses problems connected with the participation of the Ruthenian ethnic group in the battle, while in the second part of his study he deals with the issue of interpretation and perception of the battle in the early Slavic orthodox culture from the 15th to the 17th centuries (“Tannenberg und die ostlawische orthodoxe Welt”, pp. 309–320). The coherent article written by Alvydas

Nikžentaitis includes an analysis of the Grunwald phenomenon as an element of contemporary collective memory with an international dimension (“Internationales Gedenken an die Schlacht bei Tannenberg”, pp. 321–328).

The publication concludes with a valuable and demonstrative conclusion prepared by Werner Paravicini (“Schlusswort”, pp. 329–340), and a combined name and geographical index, which complements the volume together with the list of the authors of published texts and a short German-Polish index of local names (pp. 345–356).

Krzysztof Kwiatkowski (Toruń)