

ORDINES MILITARES
COLLOQUIA TORUNENSIA HISTORICA
Yearbook for the Study of the Military Orders

vol. XVII (2012)



Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

EDITORIAL BOARD

Roman Czaja, Editor in Chief, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń
Jürgen Sarnowsky, Editor in Chief, University of Hamburg

Jochen Burgtorf, California State University
Sylvain Gouguenheim, École Normale Supérieure Lettres et Sciences Humaines de Lyon
Hubert Houben, Università del Salento Lecce
Alan V. Murray, University of Leeds
Krzysztof Kwiatkowski, Assistant Editor, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń

REVIEWERS:

Darius von Guettner, School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, University of Melbourne
Sławomir Józwiak, Institute of History and Archival Sciences, Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń
Tomasz Jurek, Institute of History of Polish Academy of Sciences
Juhan Kreem, City Archives of Tallinn
Johannes A. Mol, Institute for History, University Leiden
Maria Starnawska, Institute of History, Jan Długosz University in Częstochowa
Sławomir Zonnenberg, Institute of History and International Relationships, Kazimierz Wielki University in Bydgoszcz

ADDRESS OF EDITORIAL OFFICE:

Instytut Historii i Archiwistyki UMK, ul. Gagarina 9
87-100 Toruń
e-mail: rc@umk.pl
juergen.sarnowsky@uni-hamburg.de

Subscriptions orders should be addressed to:
books@umk.pl

Printed in Poland

© Copyright by Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
© Copyright by Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

ISSN 0867-2008

NICOLAUS COPERNICUS UNIVERSITY PRESS

EDITORIAL OFFICE: ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

tel. (0) 56 611 42 95, fax (0) 56 611 47 05

e-mail: wydawnictwo@umk.pl

DISTRIBUTION: ul. Reja 25, 87-100 Toruń

tel./fax (0) 56 611 42 38

e-mail: books@umk.pl

www.wydawnictwoumk.pl

First edition

Print: Nicolaus Copernicus University Press
ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

CONTENTS

I. STUDIES AND ARTICLES FROM THE 16TH ORDINES MILITARES CONFERENCE

<i>Philippe Josserand</i> (Nantes) Grenze(n) und geistliche Ritterorden in der lateinischen Welt des Mittelalters	7
<i>Damien Carraz</i> (Clermont-Ferrand) <i>Sub eiusdem pacis et treugue Dei defensione</i> . Die Ritterorden und der Frieden in Südfrankreich im 12. Jahrhundert	17
<i>Alan Forey</i> (Kirtlington) The Participation of the Military Orders in Truces with Muslims in the Holy Land and Spain during the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries	41
<i>Shlomo Lotan</i> (Ramat-Gan) The Battle of La Forbie (1244) and its Aftermath – Re-examination of the Military Orders’ Involvement in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem in the mid-Thirteenth Century	53
<i>Jürgen Sarnowsky</i> (Hamburg) Die Ritterorden und der Krieg von St. Sabas	69
<i>Pierre Bonneaud</i> (Uzès) Negotiation and warfare: The Hospitallers of Rhodes around and after the Fall of Constantinople (1426–1480)	81
<i>Helen J. Nicholson</i> (Cardiff) The Hospitallers’ and Templars’ involvement in warfare on the frontiers of the British Isles in the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries	105

II. OTHER STUDIES

- László Pószán* (Debrecen)
Der Deutsche Orden im mittelalterlichen Ungarn 123
- Christian Vogel* (Saarbrücken)
Meisterwahlen in den mittelalterlichen Ritterorden – Johanniter, Templer
und Deutscher Orden im Vergleich 137

III. MISCELLANEOUS AND OTHER MATERIALS

- Paweł A. Jeziorski* (Toruń)
Das Verzeichnis der von Hochmeister Ludwig von Erlichshausen
Begnadigten. Eine Quelle zur Geschichte der hochmeisterlichen
Landrundreise in den Jahren 1450–1451 157

IV. BOOK REVIEWS AND BOOK NOTICES

- Documents Concerning Cyprus from the Hospital's Rhodian Archives: 1409–1459*,
ed. Karl Borchardt, Anthony Luttrell, Ekhard Schöffler (*Jürgen Sarnowsky*) 203
- Zsolt Hunyadi, *The Hospitallers in the Medieval Kingdom of Hungary c. 1150–
–1387* (*Gábor Bradács*) 204
- Bernhart Jähmig, Verfassung und Verwaltung des Deutschen Ordens und seiner
Herrschaft in Livland (*Piotr Oliński*) 206
- Máté Molnár, *A templomos lovagrend alkonya* (*Ádám Debreczeni*) 208
- Nicholas Edward Morton, *The Teutonic Knights in the Holy Land 1190–1291*
(*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 211
- Anat Peled, *Sugar in the Kingdom of Jerusalem. A Crusader Technology between
East and West* (*Shlomo Lotan*) 213
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Templer* (*Maria Starnawska*) 215
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Johanniter. Ein geistlicher Ritterorden in Mittelalter und
Neuzeit* (*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 217
- Magdalena Satora, *Sprawa templariuszy w dyplomacji zachodnioeuropejskiej 1307–
–1312* (*Piotr Oliński*) 221
- Tannenberg – Grunwald – Žalgiris 1410. Krieg und Frieden im späten Mittelalter*,
hrsg. v. Werner Paravicini, Rimvydas Petrauskas, Grischa Vercamer (*Krzysztof
Kwiatkowski*) 222

European countries, which played the same role in terms of economic protection for the headquarters of the order. The few commanderies run by brothers in Chwarszczany and Lesnica did not differ from other outposts of the order. The economic role of such centres is outlined in the book, including the necessity to provide horses for the brothers in the Levant. In this part, more attention could have been paid to issues of the national and social composition of the order.

The dramatic collapse of the order is shown in the wider context of the situation which ensued following the fall of Acre in 1291, which brought into question the existence of institutions involved in the crusade movement. The author extensively discusses various proposals concerning the reorganisation of the movement put forward by theologians and writers at the turn of the 13th and 14th centuries, i.e. the fusion of the Hospitallers and the Knights Templar. The author rightfully states that no response to such proposals by the order was a direct reason for its fall; after all, the Order of the Knights of the Holy Sepulchre could be regarded as no longer useful. However, the author fails to stress the fact that the Hospitallers survived because they participated in actions not connected with the crusades, unlike the Knights Templar. Political reasons, particularly the policy of Philip IV the Fair, are accorded minor importance, which seems correct as inquisition proceedings were severe only in Cyprus, where the Knights Templar were involved in a dynastic crisis. Despite this, the order was dissolved, which gave the opportunity for many monarchs and later the Knights Hospitaller to take over the order's property. The community of the Knights of the Holy Sepulchre proved to be closely connected with the crusade movement – it was created to solve the problems arising in the movement, and it was unable to perform any other actions not connected with crusades, which would have enabled the order to survive.

The book is somewhat concise, but it does emphasise the most important issues concerning the history of the Knights Templar and inspires further reflections on the subject.

Maria Starnawska (Częstochowa)

Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Johanniter. Ein geistlicher Ritterorden in Mittelalter und Neuzeit* (Beck'sche Reihe 2737), Verlag C.H.Beck, München 2011, 128 pp., 6 illustrations, 3 maps, ISBN 973-3-406-62239-7.

The book is the third work of this Hamburg-based scholar published in the series "C.H.Beck Wissen", devoted to the military orders. Like the first two books,

which dealt with the Teutonic Order (vol. 2428) and the Knights Templar (vol. 2472), this volume constitutes an attempt to present the rich history of the Knights Hospitaller from the beginning of the corporation at the turn of the 11th and 12th centuries up to even modern times. J. Sarnowsky manages to provide an introduction to several centuries of the order in only three chapters, which should be accessible even to those who are not familiar with the history of military orders.

Chapter I („Die Anfänge“, pp. 10–39) consists of 9 sections in which the author discusses the most important stages of the functioning of the Hospitallers in the Palestinian period (until 1291). It discusses the issue that (due to insufficient sources) little is known about the beginnings of the corporation rooted in the hospital of St. John the Baptist, which soon became independent. (J. Sarnowsky advocates the view that the hospital emerged from the male Benedictine monastery of St. Maria Latina); in 1112 and 1113 it received its first papal privileges (pp. 10–14). The subsequent two decades were marked by a quite close relationship with the cathedral chapter of the patriarchal Church of the Holy Sepulchre – by this time the young hospital community was perceived as one of the three main supports of the patriarchs of Jerusalem (together with the Canons of the Holy Sepulchre and Knights Templar) (pp. 14–15).

The author goes on to describe the process by which the organization was transformed into an order, confirmed legally by the papal privileges of 1135 and 1137 (pp. 17–18). The organizational changes were accompanied by a rapid material growth as a result of the granting of numerous estates, rents or rights, both in Palestine and in Europe (from the first decade of the 12th century, pp. 15–16, 22–25). While the organization was still led by Raymond du Puy, there took place the first codification of legal regulations concerning the new community, whose rule was confirmed by Pope Eugenius III (p. 17). At the time of the creation of the order another change took place: the militarization of the young order. From 1136 the Hospitallers had to perform military duties connected with the protection of their castles in the Holy Land. Despite some objections in the corporation and the ambivalent attitude of some popes, the Hospitallers were given more and more military responsibilities in the subsequent decades of the 12th century until the beginning of the 13th century (e.g. their military participation in the Egyptian campaigns of King Amalric I in the 1160s) (pp. 19–22).

The next sections deal with the military involvement of the Hospitallers with the Latin powers in the Levant (which was accompanied by the growing role of the order on the political and diplomatic scene (pp. 25–29)) and a short-term crisis in the last decade of the 12th century caused by the fact that the Latins lost most of their territory in the Holy Land, including Jerusalem, between 1187 and 1189 (pp. 29–31). The author also presents (briefly but transparently) various conflicts

between the Hospital and other institutions, including the Palestinian barons, in the 13th century (e.g. conflicts concerning the government of the Principality of Antioch and the abbey of St. Sabas in Acre). From the 1250s onwards the Latin powers in the Levant were progressively weakened (pp. 31–34), which in the period 1265–1291 (with a short episode of peace in the years 1277–1280) led to the loss of all Latin properties situated on the mainland (pp. 35–37) due to the extensive offensive activities of the Egyptian Mamluks. As a result the military orders, including the Hospitallers, came in for a lot of criticism. Their reaction consisted in the preparation of a new crusade expedition to Palestine at the turn of the 13th and 14th centuries (pp. 38–39). The section discussing the problem is the last one in Chapter I, and it interrupts the chronologically ordered narration of the internal structures of the order in the 12th–15th centuries, which the reader may find in Chapter II “Die Strukturen der Johanniter” (pp. 40–78).

Chapter II starts with a description of the process of the formation of the monastic statutes which lasted until the first decades of the 13th century. They were modified a few times within the following two centuries. The need to have a uniform version of the monastic law resulted in the publication of a new version of the statutes (*Stabilimenta*) in the general chapter in 1489, confirmed by the Pope in 1493 (pp. 40–44). In the second section J. Sarnowsky discusses the structure of the main monastic positions and the functions attributed to them from the end of the 15th century, pointing out the changes taking place in this sphere over 350 years (pp. 44–47). Next, the reader is acquainted with more detailed organizational questions relating to the period at Rhodes (pp. 47–54) and the structure of power exercised from 1306–1310 by the Hospitallers there and on other larger islands of the Dodecanese (pp. 54–60). The author devotes a separate section (pp. 60–65) to the organization and functioning of commanderies in Western Europe in the 14th–15th centuries, as they provided resources to finance the military activity of the Hospital in the Holy Land and Rhodes. The order’s economic activity, including trade, in the Mediterranean area and in the north is treated separately (pp. 65–68), prior to a discussion of the structures and practice of managing the corporation’s finances in the 14th–15th centuries (pp. 68–71). The last two sections deviate slightly from the theme of the chapter, one of them being devoted to the spiritual and noble/knightly identity of the order (pp. 71–75) and the other to the activity of the corporation’s members in the field of science and patronage (pp. 75–78).

Chapter III, entitled “Der Weg in die Moderne” (pp. 79–115), has like Chapter I, a chronological structure, and gives the history of the order from its rule on Rhodes to the loss of its properties on Malta along with a brief review of the history of the corporation in the 19th and 20th centuries. After dealing with events relating

to the acquisition of Dodecanese islands in the first decade of the 14th century (pp. 79–82), J. Sarnowsky discusses the elaborate process by which the Hospitallers took over the properties of the order of the Knights Templar, which was dissolved in 1312 (pp. 82–86). The third section (pp. 86–90) discusses the growing power of the Hospitallers on Rhodes in the 14th century, which is connected with the topic of the subsequent section on the crusades initiated by the Hospital in the 14th century (pp. 90–94). The last decades of the 14th century in Western Europe were dominated by the problem of the papal schism, which Sarnowsky presents from the perspective of the Hospital's involvement in conflicts in the Western Church (pp. 94–98). In the same period, particularly from the second decade of the 15th century in the eastern part of the Mediterranean zone, there started to emerge a new military group with an highly expansive attitude – the Ottoman Turks, who posed a danger to the Latin possessions in the area, the Dodecanese being particularly exposed to their attacks. That is why J. Sarnowsky devotes a separate section (pp. 99–103) to the Turkish threat, which is followed by a description of the last decades of the Hospitallers' rule in the area and on Rhodes, which eventually fell to the Turks after the siege of 1522–1523 (pp. 103–107). The penultimate section (pp. 107–112) deals with the transfer of the headquarters of the order to Malta in 1530 and its 170-year-long stay there, the first stage of which was dominated by sea battles with the Ottoman Turks. Next follows the previously mentioned brief presentation of the history of the order in the 19th and 20th centuries. From this point the order is now referred to as the Knights of Malta (including the Protestant faction of the Hospitallers restored in the mid-19th century, pp. 112–115).

The narrative part of the publication closes with a short reflection on the entire 900-year-long history of the order. The volume is completed with an index of masters and grand masters of the order (pp. 119–120) and a bibliography of the most important sources and literature (pp. 121–124) complemented by a name index (pp. 125–128). This brief and well-written book will undoubtedly serve historians who are interested in the history of military orders, particularly in the crusade movement. Yet it can also be recommended to readers who wish to start their intellectual adventure on the topic.

Krzysztof Kwiatkowski (Toruń)