

ORDINES MILITARES
COLLOQUIA TORUNENSIA HISTORICA
Yearbook for the Study of the Military Orders

vol. XVII (2012)



Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

EDITORIAL BOARD

Roman Czaja, Editor in Chief, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń
Jürgen Sarnowsky, Editor in Chief, University of Hamburg

Jochen Burgtorf, California State University
Sylvain Gouguenheim, École Normale Supérieure Lettres et Sciences Humaines de Lyon
Hubert Houben, Università del Salento Lecce
Alan V. Murray, University of Leeds
Krzysztof Kwiatkowski, Assistant Editor, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń

REVIEWERS:

Darius von Guettner, School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, University of Melbourne
Sławomir Józwiak, Institute of History and Archival Sciences, Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń
Tomasz Jurek, Institute of History of Polish Academy of Sciences
Juhan Kreem, City Archives of Tallinn
Johannes A. Mol, Institute for History, University Leiden
Maria Starnawska, Institute of History, Jan Długosz University in Częstochowa
Sławomir Zonnenberg, Institute of History and International Relationships, Kazimierz Wielki University in Bydgoszcz

ADDRESS OF EDITORIAL OFFICE:

Instytut Historii i Archiwistyki UMK, ul. Gagarina 9
87-100 Toruń
e-mail: rc@umk.pl
juergen.sarnowsky@uni-hamburg.de

Subscriptions orders should be addressed to:
books@umk.pl

Printed in Poland

© Copyright by Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
© Copyright by Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

ISSN 0867-2008

NICOLAUS COPERNICUS UNIVERSITY PRESS

EDITORIAL OFFICE: ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

tel. (0) 56 611 42 95, fax (0) 56 611 47 05

e-mail: wydawnictwo@umk.pl

DISTRIBUTION: ul. Reja 25, 87-100 Toruń

tel./fax (0) 56 611 42 38

e-mail: books@umk.pl

www.wydawnictwoumk.pl

First edition

Print: Nicolaus Copernicus University Press
ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

CONTENTS

I. STUDIES AND ARTICLES FROM THE 16TH ORDINES MILITARES CONFERENCE

<i>Philippe Josserand</i> (Nantes) Grenze(n) und geistliche Ritterorden in der lateinischen Welt des Mittelalters	7
<i>Damien Carraz</i> (Clermont-Ferrand) <i>Sub eiusdem pacis et treugue Dei defensione</i> . Die Ritterorden und der Frieden in Südfrankreich im 12. Jahrhundert	17
<i>Alan Forey</i> (Kirtlington) The Participation of the Military Orders in Truces with Muslims in the Holy Land and Spain during the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries	41
<i>Shlomo Lotan</i> (Ramat-Gan) The Battle of La Forbie (1244) and its Aftermath – Re-examination of the Military Orders’ Involvement in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem in the mid-Thirteenth Century	53
<i>Jürgen Sarnowsky</i> (Hamburg) Die Ritterorden und der Krieg von St. Sabas	69
<i>Pierre Bonneaud</i> (Uzès) Negotiation and warfare: The Hospitallers of Rhodes around and after the Fall of Constantinople (1426–1480)	81
<i>Helen J. Nicholson</i> (Cardiff) The Hospitallers’ and Templars’ involvement in warfare on the frontiers of the British Isles in the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries	105

II. OTHER STUDIES

- László Pószán* (Debrecen)
Der Deutsche Orden im mittelalterlichen Ungarn 123
- Christian Vogel* (Saarbrücken)
Meisterwahlen in den mittelalterlichen Ritterorden – Johanniter, Templer
und Deutscher Orden im Vergleich 137

III. MISCELLANEOUS AND OTHER MATERIALS

- Paweł A. Jeziorski* (Toruń)
Das Verzeichnis der von Hochmeister Ludwig von Erlichshausen
Begnadigten. Eine Quelle zur Geschichte der hochmeisterlichen
Landrundreise in den Jahren 1450–1451 157

IV. BOOK REVIEWS AND BOOK NOTICES

- Documents Concerning Cyprus from the Hospital's Rhodian Archives: 1409–1459*,
ed. Karl Borchardt, Anthony Luttrell, Ekhard Schöffler (*Jürgen Sarnowsky*) 203
- Zsolt Hunyadi, *The Hospitallers in the Medieval Kingdom of Hungary c. 1150–
–1387* (*Gábor Bradács*) 204
- Bernhart Jähmig, Verfassung und Verwaltung des Deutschen Ordens und seiner
Herrschaft in Livland (*Piotr Oliński*) 206
- Máté Molnár, *A templomos lovagrend alkonya* (*Ádám Debreczeni*) 208
- Nicholas Edward Morton, *The Teutonic Knights in the Holy Land 1190–1291*
(*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 211
- Anat Peled, *Sugar in the Kingdom of Jerusalem. A Crusader Technology between
East and West* (*Shlomo Lotan*) 213
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Templer* (*Maria Starnawska*) 215
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Johanniter. Ein geistlicher Ritterorden in Mittelalter und
Neuzeit* (*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 217
- Magdalena Satora, *Sprawa templariuszy w dyplomacji zachodnioeuropejskiej 1307–
–1312* (*Piotr Oliński*) 221
- Tannenberg – Grunwald – Žalgiris 1410. Krieg und Frieden im späten Mittelalter*,
hrsg. v. Werner Paravicini, Rimvydas Petrauskas, Grischa Vercamer (*Krzysztof
Kwiatkowski*) 222

Nicholas Edward Morton, *The Teutonic Knights in the Holy Land 1190–1291*, The Boydell Press, Woodbridge 2009, xiv + 228 pp., 1 map, ISBN 978-1-84383-477-9.

Even a cursory survey of reviews published in the last two years in English concerning the publication discussed here (e.g. by W. Urban, T. Toomaspoeg and T. F. Madden) shows that the book has met with great interest within the scholarly world. Undoubtedly it had been felt for a long time that there was a demand for a separate monograph (after the thematically more extensive works of K. Forstreuter, H. Kluger or K. Militzer, not to mention articles by W. Hubatsch, H. E. Mayer, U. Arnold, and M. Favreau-Lilie) devoted exclusively to the functioning of the Teutonic Order in the Levant (particularly in the context of recent archaeological research at Montfort Castle). The book may be said to meet such expectations. Considering that structural research so far has concentrated on the Teutonic Order's lands in Europe, particularly in the Baltic region, the PhD dissertation of N. E. Morton defended in 2007, should win our approval.

The study, which starts with a short introduction (pp. 1–8), consists of 10 chapters ending with a brief conclusion (pp. 185–188). There are 6 appendixes including registers of all grand masters from the Palestinian period, two lists of the order's dominions in the Holy Land, and lists of masters, marshals and grand commanders of the Teutonic Order up to 1291 (pp. 189–206).

The topic of each chapter corresponds to the chronological order of the researched material. This does not mean a chronologically ordered narration of events, but rather a systematic presentation of issues which occur successively. In the first four chapters (“The Foundation of the Order, 1190–1215”, pp. 9–30; “The Fifth Crusade and the Development of the Teutonic Knights, 1216–1223”, pp. 31–42; “The Preparations for the Expedition of Frederick II”, pp. 43–59; “From the Crusade of Emperor Frederick II to the Death of Hermann von Salza, 1227–1239”, pp. 60–84) the author discusses the beginnings of the Teutonic Order in Palestine and its dynamic development during the thirty-year-term of office of Grand Master Hermann von Salza. Most of the analyses included here are based on research to date (e.g. U. Arnold, M. Favreau-Lilie and K. Militzer in relation to the beginnings of the order; U. Arnold and J. M. Powell on relations with Frederick II, with limited reference – and by no means positive – to the work of H. Kluger), and the English historian repeats opinions about Hermann von Salza's great independence from Frederick II, which can be found in literature on the subject. That is why the Teutonic Order cannot be defined as the “dynastic order of knighthood” (German: ‘Hausorden’) of the house of Hohenstaufen.

In the subsequent two chapters (“Conrad von Thüringen, the Barons' Crusade and a Change of Policy”, pp. 85–95; “Dependence and Independence”, pp.

96–117) N. E. Morton presents internal conflicts within the order after 1239 connected with the creation of two think tanks (which differed on the question of the corporation's position in the conflict between the Pope and the Emperor), relations with the Hospitallers (exacerbated in the 1240s), relations with the Templars, the activities of the Teutonic Order during the crusade of Louis IX, and contacts with Italian towns. Chapter VII ("The Division of Resources between the Holy Land and the Baltic", pp. 118–130) addresses the problem concerning the scale of human and material provision for the order's activities in the Levant and in the Baltic region, including the quantitative and qualitative relations between them. The author expresses the opinion that the situation in the Baltic area hindered the activity of the Teutonic Knights in Palestine. He also forms a thesis that as a result of the Baltic crusades, German-speaking knights started to leave the Levant. Both of these opinions have been heavily criticized by K. Toomaspoeg. Chapter VIII ("The Politics of the Levant", pp. 131–143) constitutes the last chapter of the book, and discussing political questions and the course of events. Outlining the worsening situation of the Latins in Outremer, which also affected the military orders (including the Teutonic Order), the author discusses relations between the Teutonic Knights and the kings of Cyprus from the Capetian House of Anjou, the growing interference of popes in the matters of the Holy Land, and also the joint activities of the three great orders in the Levant, the aim of which was to combine their powers in the face of the threat from the Mamluks. It seems that the author underestimates the involvement of the heads of the Teutonic Order in the defence of their dominions in northern Palestine, as well as their determination to do so, which was reflected in the amount of financial resources devoted to that aim.

In the last two chapters ("The Military Organisation of the Teutonic Knights in the Holy Land", pp. 144–158; "Control, Co-ordination and Supply", pp. 159–184) N. E. Morton examines the internal structures of the corporation in relation to their military activity, discussing the statutes of the order, the office of marshal, the castles of the order in the Levant, and finally estimating the human potential of the army assigned there by the corporation. Next, he outlines the internal organization of the Teutonic Order, going beyond the military dimension (mainly on the basis of literature to date), the functioning of the office of grand master, the institution of general chapters, the offices of dignitaries of the Teutonic Order, and the question of the main house of the corporation (the author rejects the established opinion that the main house was situated in Montfort, and situates it exclusively in Acre throughout all Palestinian period). At the end of the last chapter the reader may find an analysis of the dominions of the Teutonic Knights in Palestine, their revenue from the countryside and property and rights granted in the cities, as well as material support from their European houses.

N. E. Morton's book constitutes the first comprehensive presentation of the Palestinian aspect of the Teutonic Order. Irrespective of some controversial theses, the book is a valuable publication which may serve as a starting point for further research.

Krzysztof Kwiatkowski (Toruń)

Anat Peled, *Sugar in the Kingdom of Jerusalem. A Crusader Technology between East and West*, Yad Ben-Zvi Institute, Jerusalem 2009, 287 pp., ISBN 978-9-65217-292-1 (in Hebrew, Table of contents also in English).

Historical research in the later 20th century often attributed colonial intentions and practice to the Latin kingdom of Jerusalem, on the grounds that most crusaders settled in the coastal cities, making no contribution to the region and keeping themselves separate from the local population. This claim has been challenged in a number of studies, for example by Ronnie Ellenblum, who maintains that the spread of rural settlements demonstrates that the crusaders were actually involved in local economic activities in various parts of the Latin Kingdom, such as the environs of Jerusalem or the Galilee mountains. Anat Peled's research describes such an involvement through her account of the development of sugar growing, production and sales by crusaders in the Latin East and in Muslim territories. Dr. Peled, a researcher and lecturer at the Avshalom Institute in Tel Aviv, Israel, presents a new approach to examining the degree of crusader involvement in the eastern basin of the Mediterranean through her study of this essential industry which developed during their rule in the Latin East between 1099 and 1291. This study is based on analysis of historical sources, including documents from the archives of military orders and monastic institutions as well as written descriptions by pilgrims who visited the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem. Analysis of these sources is substantiated by Peled's thorough examination of archaeological evidence and familiarity with the various stages of sugar production.

One of the main goals of Peled's study was to examine whether the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem had incorporated manufacturing technologies imported from the West, or whether its sugar industry was based solely on oriental features anchored in local traditions. By evaluating the historical role played by the Frankish settlers in the development of this industry, which originated in the Muslim period, she intends to determine the extent to which it was embedded in Frankish economy. In the final chapter of the book, Peled concludes that crusader deve-